e-ISSN: 2550-7001 p-ISSN: 2550-701X

**VOLUME 4 / NUMBER 3 / DECEMBER 2020** 

# International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities



### International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities

#### EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Martha Cecilia Escobar Garcia (Ph.D.) Universidad Técnica de Manabí (UTM), Portoviejo, **Ecuador** 

#### $C\ H\ I\ E\ F$ $E\ X\ E\ C\ U\ T\ I\ V\ E$ $E\ D\ I\ T\ O\ R$

Maria Rodriguez

Gámez (Professor Ph.D.) Author ID: 57204684841 Universidad Técnica de Manabí, Portoviejo, **Ecuador** 

#### EDITORIAL BOARD

Jesús Alberto Pérez Rodríguez (Prof. Dr.), Universidad Central de Venezuela, Caracas, **Venezuela** 

Wuhan University of Technology, Wuhan, **China** 

Cheng Guoping (Ph.D.),

Ruhul Amin, NPI University of Bangladesh, Manikganj, **Bangladesh** 

Edwin Alexander Rodriguez Veliz (Ph.D.), Universidad Técnica de Manabí, Portoviejo, **Ecuador**  Ogbo Anastasia Ifechukwudebelu (Dr.), University of Nigeria, Nsukka, **Nigeria**  Robert Masterson (Prof.), City University of New York, New York, **USA** 

Mohamed Anifa Mohamed Fowsar (Ph.D.), South Eastern University of Sri Lanka (SEUSL), Oluvil, **Sri Lanka**  Maricela Victoria Reyes Espinosa (Ph.D.), Universidad Técnica de Manabí, Portoviejo, **Ecuador**  Melissa Studdard (Prof. Dr.), Lone Star College System, **USA** 

Paras Jain Shiksharatan (Dr.), Sarguja University, Chhattisgarh, **India**  Krishantha Wisenthige (Ph.D.), Wuhan University of Technology, Wuhan, **China**  Karthikeyan Chinnusamy (Ph.D.), Veritas Tech & International Technological University, **USA** 

Wayan Suryasa (Dr.), Author ID: 57200211897, STIKOM Bali, Denpasar, **Indonesia**  Irma Shioshvili (Prof.), Iakob Gogebashvili Telavi State University, Telavi, **Georgia**  Jayasri Santhappan (Ph.D.), University of Houston, **USA** 

Alexander V. Obskov (Dr.), English as a Second Language, National Research Tomsk Polytechnic University, **Russia** 

#### INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY BOARD

Odiwo Williams Omokhudu (Ph.D.), Edo University, Iyamho, **Nigeria** 

Roslan Abdul Hakim (Professor Dr.), Universiti Utara Malaysia, Changlun, **Malaysia** 

Ahdi Hassan (Prof.), Corpus linguistics and Forensic Linguistics, Islamabad, **Pakistan**  Seeni Mohamed Aliff (Ph.D), South Eastern University of Sri Lanka (SEUSL), Oluvil, **Sri Lanka** 

Ted F.L. Jing (Ph.D.), Shanghai International Studies University (SISU), Shanghai, **China** 

Zubitashvili Tamar (Prof), Iakob Gogebashvili Telavi State University, **Georgia**  Hauwa Daniyan Bagudu (Ph.D), Universiti Utara Malaysia, Changlun, **Malaysia** 

Mónica Katherine Murillo Mora (Ph.D.), Universidad Técnica de Manabí, Portoviejo, **Ecuador** 

#### PRODUCTION EDITOR

John McMurray University of Glasgow, United Kingdom Jacque H. Georger Shipley Company, United States

#### MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE

**M. I. Bordelois**, Medicine, Universidad Técnica de Manabí, **Ecuador**  **A. V. Perez** (Professor Dr.) Formaciónambiental, Bilbao, España, **Spain**  **J. M. R. Díaz** (Prof. Ph.D.) Universidad Técnica de Manabí (UTM), Portoviejo, **Ecuador** 

M. C. E. Garcia (Ph.D.) Universidad Técnica de Manabí (UTM), Portoviejo, **Ecuador** 

#### W E B M A S T E R

**Vedran Vucic** PKP Developer, Belgrade

#### COPYRIGHT AND COPYING (IN ANY FORMAT)

Articles published in the International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities (**IJSSH**) are available under *Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial No Derivatives Licence (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0).* Authors retain copyright in their work and grant **IJSSH** right of first publication under CC BY-NC-ND 4.0. Users have the right to read, download, copy, distribute, print, search, or link to the full texts of articles in this journal, and to use them for any other lawful purpose. Articles published in **IJSSH** can be copied, communicated and shared in their published form for non-commercial purposes provided full attribution is given to the author and the journal. Authors are able to enter into separate, additional contractual arrangements for the non-exclusive distribution of the journal's published version of the work (e.g., post it to an institutional repository or publish it in a book), with an acknowledgment of its initial publication in this journal.

#### DISCLAIMER

The Publisher and Editors cannot be held responsible for errors or any consequences arising from the use of information contained in this journal; the views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the Publisher and Editors, neither does the publication of advertisements constitute any endorsement by the Publisher and Editors of the products advertised.

For submission instructions, subscription and all other information visit: https://sciencescholar.us/journal/index.php/ijssh/

# International Journal of Social Sciences Humanities

Research Articles	Pages
COVID-19 pandemic handling community social and cultural sector stimulus efforts  I Nengah Merta, I Wayan Suderana	1
The understanding of tourist preferences toward selection of wet-based tourism destination  Noor Rahmini, Rizali	13
Physical evidence promotion on consumer decisions in using bowling sport services  Muhammad Fajar Ariwibowo, Zakaria Wahab, Raden Isnanta, Isnurhadi	22
The quality of public services to the level of satisfaction Mustamin, Siti Atika Rahmi	29
Role models on student's entrepreneurial intentions: A case study Judith I. Aloamaka, Anthony Anyibuofu Kifordu, C.G.E. Salami	40
Brand credibility and marketing performance in the Nigerian brewery industry  A. P. Olannye, Raphael Ndidi Dibie	56

Improving the quality of education through technical proficiency Arnadi, Hifza, Dedi. S	68
Problematic economic empowerment and prospectus of human resource development through establishment of economic study program based on Hindu cultural  I Putu Sugih Arta	75
The differences of audit quality on the regulation of audit tenure and auditor rotation in Indonesia Ni Made Puspa Pawitri, Anak Agung Gde Putu Widanaputra, Ketut Muliartha RM, I Nyoman Wijana Asmara Putra	88
Impact of social networks on student academic performance Nancy Azucena Bazurto Briones, María Elena Moya Martínez	99
The effectiveness of driving license services in police station traffic unit Abdulhalil Hi. Ibrahim, Thamrin Husain, Samsul Bahri Handji, Bakri La Suhu	107
Government communication patterns in Ambon city budget policy Pahrul Idham Kaliky, Marno Wance, Herizal Herizal	114
How dangerous the Indonesian recession due to COVID-19 pandemic: review policy and strategy to recovery  Marjan Miharja, Sri Setiawati, Amanda Lestari Putri Lubis	121
Dimensions of public services: A portrait of irony facilities for disabilities  Taufik Irfadat, Nurlaila, Haeril, Tauhid	130
The bureaucratic political relation model in perception of officers publicA study on bima city government  Tauhid, Mukhlis Ishaka, Kamaluddin, Muhammad Taufiq	142
Alternative media for the preservation of traditional arts through collaboration pop art style wayang pacitan beber  B Pujiono, B H Prilosadoso, S Supeni	151

María Magdalena Barahona Lino, Mariana Natasha Zambrano Barreiro, Patricia Gabriela Chong Baque, María Andrea Mendoza Cevallos, Enrique Byron Ayón Parrales	
<b>Hanoman's 2D animated character in ramayana wayang story</b> S H Heriwati, B Pujiono, A N Panindias, Suwondo Suwondo, B H Prilosadoso	168

160

Evaluation focused on processes to improve the academic performance

of students



## Universidad Técnica de Manabí

Av. Urbina y Che Guevara, APARTADO: 82 (Ecuador/South America)



#### **International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities**

Available online at www.sciencescholar.us Vol. 4 No. 3 December 2020, pages: 88-98 e-ISSN: 2550-7001, p-ISSN: 2550-701X https://doi.org/10.29332/ijssh.v4n3.461



#### The Differences of Audit Quality on the Regulation of Audit Tenure and Auditor Rotation in Indonesia



Ni Made Puspa Pawitri<sup>a</sup>, Anak Agung Gde Putu Widanaputra<sup>b</sup>, Ketut Muliartha RM<sup>c</sup>, I Nyoman Wijana Asmara Putra<sup>d</sup>

Manuscript submitted: 27 August 2020, Manuscript revised: 09 September 2020, Accepted for publication: 18 October 2020

#### Corresponding Author a



#### Keywords

audit quality; audit tenure; auditor rotation; consecutive financial; regulations;

#### **Abstract**

This study examines the differences in audit quality on the regulation of audit tenure and auditor rotation in Indonesia. In Indonesia, there have been several audit-related scandals that occurred after the implementation of regulations on the audit tenure limitation and auditor rotation. The last regulation that applies to date is the Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia No. 20/2015 about Public Accountant Practices Chapter V regarding the Limitation of Audit Services in Article 11 that the provision of audit services on a historical financial statement on an entity by a Public Accountant is limited to a maximum of five consecutive financial years. These analyses use discretionary accruals as audit-quality proxies. In this study, the output of audit quality is measured, namely the earnings quality. This research was conducted on all non-financial companies listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange start from 2012 to 2017, using the purposive sampling method obtained 554 research samples. Hypothesis analyses in this study use different test analysis. Specifically, there is a significant difference in the audit quality in the first year of the tenure and the last year of the tenure. We also find significant differences in audit quality before and after auditor rotation.

International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities © 2020.

This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

#### **Contents**

A	bstract	88
	Introduction	89
	Materials and Methods	91
3	Results and Discussions	93
	Conclusion	95

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Faculty of Economics and Business, University of Udayana, Denpasar, Indonesia

b Faculty of Economics and Business, University of Udayana, Denpasar, Indonesia

Faculty of Economics and Business, University of Udayana, Denpasar, Indonesia

d Faculty of Economics and Business, University of Udayana, Denpasar, Indonesia

Acknowledgments	95
References	96
Biography of Authors	98

#### 1 Introduction

The financial statements of a company are a source of information regarding operational activities and financial position which will later be used for decision making. The purpose of financial statements is to provide information regarding the financial position, performance, and changes in the financial position of a company that is useful for a large number of users in economic decisions making. Company data will be more easily trusted by investors and other users of financial statements if the financial statements that reflect the company's financial performance and condition have received a fair statement from the auditors (Komalasari, 2004). Audit quality of a financial statement is intended to reduce the risk of information contained in it and will help to improve the quality of decision making (Arens, 2008; Kirana & Ramantha, 2020). The way to improve the quality of financial statements is to increase audit quality. DeAngelo (1981), defined audit quality as the probability of an auditor to discover and report the breach in the client's accounting system, and the ability to detect a breach and report it to depend on the auditor's ability. Thus, audit quality is a function of the technical proficiency/competence of the auditors and the auditor's independence relative to company management so that he can report these accounting breaches. Improving audit quality can be achieved by increasing the competence and independence of auditors.

The regulations regarding public accounting have begun to be drawn to the government since the United States established the Public Company Accounting Oversight Board (PCAOB) (Wibowo & Hilda, 2009). Much researches have been conducted, but it still cannot provide evidence of the success in implementing the SOX Law. This is related to the loss of public trust in the lack of regulation by professional associations, starting with the failure of CPA firm Arthur Andersen to maintain its independence from its clients, Enron and Worldcom, which led to the bankruptcy of Arthur Andersen as a member of The Big 5 Auditors. Coupled with the emergence of a case in 2004 Kanebo (large Japanese cosmetics company), a longtime client of ChuoAoyama, revealed a massive accounting fraud and began an internal investigation which resulted in Kanebo dropping ChuoAoyama as its auditor (Skinner & Sriniyasan, 2012). ChuoAoyama is a PwC Japan affiliate and one of the largest auditing firms in Japan. Many parties placed the auditor as the part that most responsible for this case. This condition also raises the presumption that if an audit takes too long to be carried out by an auditor will be emotionally bound and reduce auditor independence. The emergence of various scandals and company collapse lately raises doubts about the audit quality (Hoyle, 1978; Imhoff, 2003), as well as indicates a decrease in the level of auditor independence, so that the need for audit firm rotation and auditor rotation is believed to improve audit quality. Schemes of limiting the length of the audit tenure and auditor rotation are among the solutions that arise to achieve a good level of audit quality. In Indonesia, the last regulation that applies to date is the Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor 20 Tahun 2015 concerning Public Accountant Practices Chapter V regarding the Limitation of Audit Services in Article 11 that the provision of audit services on a historical financial statement on an entity by a Public Accountant is limited at the latest for 5 (five) consecutive financial years. Public Accountants may return to provide audit services on the historical financial statement for the entity after 2 (two) financial years have not provided audit services to the client. In Indonesia, there have been several audit-related scandals that occurred after the implementation of regulations on the audit tenure limitation and auditor rotation. Quoted from the PCAOB page (9 February 2017) Public Company Accounting Oversight Board (PCAOB) or the Supervisory Board of the United States Public Accountant Company sentenced the Public Accounting Firm Purwanto, Suherman, and Surja along with partners Ernest and Young (EY) Indonesia, proven to play a role in the failure of PT Indosat Tbk's financial statement audit in 2011. Also, citing the Ministry of Finance's website, quoted by CNBC Indonesia, Thursday (30/08/2018), administrative sanctions were imposed on Public Accountant Marlinna, Merliyana Syamsul, and Public Accounting Firm Satrio Bing Eny and Deloitte Indonesia affiliates in connection with a complaint from the Financial Services Authority which informed the Public Accounting Firm of a breach in audit procedures. The emergence of these scandals raised questions and subsequently became a debate as to whether the limitation of the audit tenure period and the existence of audit rotation regulations in Indonesia could improve audit quality.

Audit quality can be measured in terms of input, output, and process. In this study, the output quality of the audit will be measured, namely the earnings quality. The better the earnings quality resulting from an audit process, the better the audit quality (Fitriany *et al.*, 2015). This study follows Velury & Jenkins (2006) which divides earnings quality into four dimensions, namely predictive value, neutrality, timeliness, and representational faithfulness. In this study the dimension used is neutrality.

Prior audit research literature that examining the audit quality variables as previously described has led to the desire of researchers to re-examine audit quality related to the existence of regulations on the audit tenure and auditor rotation in Indonesia. Research that examines audit quality using tests of different related to the existence of regulation of the tenure and auditor rotation is rarely encountered by the authors. Therefore, we add to this literature to obtain empirical evidence about the differences in audit quality on the regulation of audit tenure and auditor rotation in Indonesia.

"Honeymoon Effect" in the auditor and client relationship

Levinthal & Fichman (1988), found the following pattern in client and auditor relationships. First, there is a period when both parties have trust in each other, which is called the 'honeymoon' period. The likelihood of a qualified opinion increases just after that period but decreases in the continuing relationship. This is consistent with Knapp (1991), which found that after several years there is some kind of turning point in the auditor and client relationship that can harm auditor independence. Deis & Giroux (1992) also found a negative relationship between audit quality and the length of the auditor and client relationship. Levinthal & Fichman (1991), stated that the audit relationship begins with a "honeymoon" period where there is a psychological bond that is one of the assets that will affect the relationship.

#### Audit

The audit is a systematic process of obtaining and evaluating objectively the evidence of economic actions taken by management with the main purpose of proving the suitability of management assertions with predetermined criteria and then communicating the results to interested parties (Boynton *et al.*, 2001). In fulfilling the needs of users or decision-makers for quality information, the information presented in the financial statements must be checked by an independent party capable of assuring the reliability of the information.

#### Audit quality

Widiastuty & Febrianto (2010), stated that in the practical literature, audit quality is how appropriate the audit is to the auditing standard. DeAngelo (1981), defined audit quality as the probability of an auditor to discover and report the breach in the client's accounting system, and the ability to detect a breach and report it to depend on the auditor's ability. Lee *et al.*, (1999) define audit quality as the probability that the auditor will not issue the audit report with an unqualified opinion for financial statements containing material errors. Audit quality is also measured in terms of the auditor's ability to constrain the provision of discretionary accruals (Lai & Gul, 2008). Discretionary accruals represent the part of total accruals that is more prone to manipulation by managers and are frequently used in the literature as a proxy for earnings management (Jones, 1991; DeFond & Jiambalvo, 1994). The definition of audit quality above can be taken the important point that a quality audit is an audit carried out by a competent person and an independent person.

#### Auditor-Client relationship and audit quality

The long-term auditor-client relationship significantly increases the likelihood that the auditor will issue an ineligible audit report or, long service tenure significantly reduces the auditor's willingness to qualify for the audit report. According to St. Pierre & Anderson (1984), in the first three years of the audit tenure period, audit quality is still low. The low audit quality is because auditors do not understand their clients in-depth

(Francis & Simon 1987; Balvers *et al.*, 1988; Beatty, 1989; Craswell *et al.*, 1995). Meanwhile, according to Chi & Huang (2005), the level of use of abnormal accruals is low in the initial year of the audit engagement period (both at the audit office and audit executor) when compared to the following year. According to Vansterlaen (2000), auditors are more willing/less likely to issue a `clean 'audit report in the first two years of their mandate than in the last year of their mandate. This could be an indication that the decision to renew the auditor's mandate is already taken and known by the auditor before he has issued his audit report. Levinthal & Fichman (1988) found the following pattern in auditor client attachments. First, there is a period when both parties have trust in each other, which is called the 'honeymoon' period. The likelihood of a qualified opinion increases just after this period but decreases in a continuing relationship. This is also consistent with Knapp (1991), which found that after some years there is some kind of turning point in the auditor-client relationship that can be detrimental to the auditor's independence.

#### Public accounting firm

General audits of financial statements on companies operating in Indonesia are carried out by Public Accountants in a Public Accounting Firm, except for certain government-owned companies. Apart from performing financial statement audit services for clients, the Public Accounting Firm also offers accounting and bookkeeping services, tax services, and management consulting services. Public Accounting Firm in Indonesia can cooperate with foreign Public Accounting Firm. Cooperation can take the form of networks or associations (Adityasih, 2010). There are four (4) large public accounting firms in Indonesia associated with four (4) international CPA company networks, namely Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu, Ernst & Young Global, KPMG International, and PricewaterhouseCoopers.

#### Audit tenure

Audit tenure shows the duration of the engagement between the Public Accountant or the Public Accounting Firm in conducting audit services for a company in succession. The audit engagement period or audit tenure can have an impact on the auditor's performance in the client company such as the auditor-client emotional relationship, independence, fees, competence, and so on (Hamid, 2013).

#### Auditor rotation

The mandatory rotation has been widely accepted and has received recommendations from many parties because it is expected to have a significant effect on auditing practices. Although mandatory rotation has been widely discussed and is now a mandatory provision, the accounting profession has not much agreed on this matter. The accounting profession argues that this proposal will increase audit costs for clients, reduce audit quality, and provide little benefit. The government determines that the provision of audit services for historical financial statements on an entity by a Public Accountant is limited to a maximum of 5 (five) consecutive financial years. Public Accountants can return to provide audit services on historical financial statements to the entity after 2 (two) financial years have not provided audit services to the client. These regulations have caused long polemic among public accountants to date.

- H1: There are differences in audit quality between the beginning and the end of the audit tenure.
- H2: There are differences in the quality of audits before the auditor rotation and after the auditor rotation.

#### 2 Materials and Methods

This research begins by determining the objectives where this study aims to obtain empirical evidence about the analysis of differences in audit quality based on the neutrality value of the regulation of the audit tenure and auditor rotation in Indonesia. The location of this research is conducted on the Indonesia Stock Exchange (IDX) through the Indonesian Capital Market Directory (ICMD). Apart from using ICMD, this research was also carried out by directly accessing the Indonesia Stock Exchange website, namely www.idx.co.id to obtain the

information needed for this research. The population in this study were all non-financial companies listed on the IDX for the period 2012-2017. The sampling method used was the purposive sampling approach. The data was collected using documentation from the source used, namely the audited financial statements of the sample companies. There were 290 samples in the year of observation, the namely first year of audit tenure and the last year of the audit tenure. And 264 samples in the year of observation, namely two (2) years before the auditor rotation and two (2) years after the auditor rotation.

#### Operational Definition of Variables

#### 1) Audit Tenure

The audit tenure variable shows the length of time both Public Accountant level and Public Accounting Firm perform audit services in a company consecutively in years.

#### For grouping:

The beginning of the audit tenure period: when the first initial year of the engagement period.

End of the audit tenure period: when the last year of the engagement period.

#### 2) AP Rotation

In this study, the form of rotation that was tested was rotation at the Public Accountant level, because according to the latest regulations in Indonesia, rotation regulations at the Public Accounting Firm-level are no longer required.

#### *Grouping:*

Before rotation: at the end of the two (2) years audit engagement period (audit tenure) before Public Accountant rotation.

After rotation: in the initial two (2) years of the audit engagement period (audit tenure) after Public Accountant rotation.

#### 3) Audit Quality

In this study, audit quality will be measured based on the output, namely the earnings quality. This study follows Velury & Jenkins (2006), who divides earnings quality into four dimensions, namely predictive value, timeliness, neutrality, and representational faithfulness. In this study, the dimensions used are neutrality, which means that earnings must provide unbiased information. Profit is said to be neutral if profit is not managed for a specific purpose (no earnings management). Referring also to the study of Manry *et al.*, (2008), use discretionary accruals as a measure of audit quality, so this study also uses discretionary accruals as a proxy for audit quality. This study uses the Kaznik (1999), model to measure the value of discretionary accruals because based on the research of Siregar *et al.* (2009), the Kaznik model gives better results than other models. Kasznik's (1999) model is:

 $TACC_{it} / TA_{i,t-1} = \alpha_1(1/TA_{i,t-1}) + \alpha_2(\Delta REV_{it} - \Delta REC_{it}) / TA_{i,t-1} + \alpha_3 PPE_{i,t} / TA_{i,t-1} + \alpha_4 \Delta CFO_{i,t} / TA_{i,t-1} + \epsilon_{it}$ .....(1)

#### Information:

TACC<sub>it</sub> = The total accruals of the company i in year t, ie *income before extraordinary items* reduced by operating cash flow (CFO).

 $TA_{i,t-1}$  = Total assets of the company i at the beginning of year t.

 $\Delta REV_{it}$  = Change in the company i's income between years t and t-1.

 $\Delta REC_{it}$  = Change in receivables of the company i in years t and t-1.

 $PPE_{i,t}$  = Company i's gross fixed assets in year t.

 $\Delta CFO_{i,t}$  = Change in operating cash flows between years t and t-1.

 $\varepsilon_{it}$  = Discretionary accruals (DAC).

#### 3 Results and Discussions

Hypothesis 1

Table 1
Descriptive statistics

Descriptive Statistics					
Variable	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	Minimum	Maximum
Initial DACC	145	0,057855	0,69643491	-2,09837	2,08798
Final DACC	145	-0,057855	0,71272588	-1,91027	2,07022

Source: authors' summary based on SPSS result, 2019

Table 2
One-Sample Kolmogorov-Smirnov

	One-Sample Kolmogorov-Smirnov				
Description	Initial DACC Final DACC				
N 145 145					
<i>Test Statistic</i> 0,105 0,066					
Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)	ed) 0,000 0,200				
Distribution Not Normally Distributed Normal					
Lilliefors Significance Correction					

Source: authors' summary based on SPSS result, 2019

Table 3
Wilcoxon Signed-Rank test

		Ranks		
Desc	cription	N	Mean Rank	Sum of Ranks
Final DACC	Negative Ranks	79	81,33	6425
Initial DACC	Positive Ranks	66	63,03	4160
	Ties	0		
Total		145		

Table 4 Statistics test

Statistics T	`est			
Initial DACC – Final DACC				
Z	-2,235			
Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)	0,025			
a. Wilcoxon Signed Ranks Test				
b. Based on positive ranks.				

Source: authors' summary based on SPSS result, 2019

Based on the results of the Wilcoxon Signed Rank Test statistical test in the table, it is known that the Z value is -2.235 at the significance level of 0.05. Asymp Value. Sig. (2-tailed) 0.025 is smaller than the significance of 0.05. This indicates that there is a significant difference in audit quality at the beginning of the audit tenure and the end of the audit tenure period. These results are supported by the result of Chi & Huang (2005) which found that the level of use of abnormal accruals is low in the early years of the audit engagement period (both

at the audit office and the audit executive) when compared to the following years. According to Vansterlaen (2000), auditors are more willing/less likely to issue a `clean 'audit report in the first two years of their mandate than in the last year of their mandate. This could be an indication that the decision to renew the auditor's mandate is already taken and known by the auditor before he has issued his audit report. Simmons & Lovata (2009) who in their research took a sample of public universities in the state of Illinois, United States, found that more audit findings were found in the initial period of the Public Accounting Firm engagement. The difference between the number of findings for the initial period and the end of the engagement period becomes more significant when the regulation of Public Accounting Firm rotation becomes mandatory. Fitriany (2011), proved that audit tenure and quality are quadratic in the form of concave or convex. This proves that there is a certain optimal point in providing audit services where before reaching the optimal point, tenure can be positively related to audit quality. This proves that there is an increase in competence which more dominantly affects earnings quality. However, after the optimal point, the longer the tenure will result in the auditor becoming more familiar with the client, so that independence issues are more dominant in affecting audit quality than competence.

#### Hypothesis 2

Table 5
Descriptive statistics

Descriptive Statistics					
Variable N Mean Std. Deviation Minimum Maximum					
Before	66	0,13969364	0,553621167	-1,457215	1,782675
After	66	-0,13969417	0,824380928	-3,23704	0,98988

Source: authors' summary based on SPSS result, 2019

Table 6
One-Sample Kolmogorov-Smirnov

One-Sample Kolmogorov-Smirnov				
Description Initial DACC Regression Model Final DACC Regression Model				
N	66	66		
Test Statistic	0,197			
Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed) 0,025 0,000				
Distribution	Not Normally Distributed	Not Normally Distributed		
Lilliefors Significance Correction.				

Source: authors' summary based on SPSS result, 2019

Table 7
Wilcoxon Signed-Rank test

Ranks					
Ι	Description	N	Mean Rank	Sum of Ranks	
After	Negative Ranks	42	36	1512	
Before	Positive Ranks	24	29,13	699	
	Ties	0			
Total		66			

#### Table 8 Statistics test

Statistics Test	
	After - Before
Z	-2,597
Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)	0,009
a. Wilcoxon Signed Ranks Test	
b. Based on positive ranks.	

Source: authors' summary based on SPSS result, 2019

Based on the results of the Wilcoxon Signed Rank Test statistical test in the table, it is known that the Z value is -2.59 at the significance level of 0.05. Hence Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed) 0.009 is smaller than the significance of 0.05, so the hypothesis is accepted. This indicates that there is a significant difference in audit quality before auditor rotation and after auditor rotation. This result is consistent with the research of Mautz & Sharaft (1961) found that the length of the relationship between the auditor and his client can have a detrimental effect on auditor independence, therefore rotation is necessary. Gietzmann & Sen (2002), also found that although rotation incurs a high cost, in audit markets with relatively few large clients, rotation improved incentives for independence outweigh the associated costs. Hamilton *et al.* (2005), stated that audit rotation increases conservatism in the financial condition reporting process. This means that the quality of financial statements is getting better, indicated by the lower number of unexpected accruals

#### 4 Conclusion

This study provides insights into the recent debate surrounding audit tenure, auditor rotation, and audit quality by analyzing the differences of audit quality on the regulation of audit tenure and auditor rotation in Indonesia. Based on the results of statistical testing and discussion as described in the previous chapter, it can be concluded that the first is that there is a significant difference in audit quality during the initial period of the audit tenure and at the end of the audit tenure period. Second, there are significant differences in audit quality before auditor rotation and after auditor rotation. This may be because the length of the relationship between the auditor and his client can affect auditor independence. Future research may consider using different proxies such as using industry specialist auditors, earning surprise benchmarks, or can consider using a questionnaire. The use of samples for further research can focus on one particular type of industry to reduce the bias of the research results.

#### **Acknowledgments**

We are grateful to two anonymous reviewers for their valuable comments on the earlier version of this paper.

e-ISSN: 2550-7001 🚨 p-ISSN: 2550-701X

#### References

- Adityasih, T. (2010). Analisa pengaruh pendidikan profesi, pengalaman auditor, jumlah klien (audit capacity), dan ukuran kantor akuntan publik terhadap kualitas audit. *Library UI*.
- Alvin, A. A., Elder, R. J., & Beasley, M. S. (2008). Auditing dan Jasa Assurance: Pendekatan Terintegrasi. *Penerbit Erlangga, Jakarta*.
- Balvers, R. J., McDonald, B., & Miller, R. E. (1988). Underpricing of new issues and the choice of auditor as a signal of investment banker reputation. *Accounting Review*, 605-622.
- Beatty, R. P. (1989). Auditor reputation and the pricing of initial public offerings. Accounting Review, 693-709.
- Boynton, C., Johnson, Raymond, M., Kell, & Walter G. (2001). *Modern Auditing: 7th USA*. John Willey & Sons. Inc. Chi, W., & Huang, H. (2005). Discretionary accruals, audit-firm tenure and audit-partner tenure: Empirical evidence from Taiwan. *Journal of Contemporary Accounting & Economics*, 1(1), 65-92. https://doi.org/10.1016/S1815-5669(10)70003-5
- Craswell, A. T., Francis, J. R., & Taylor, S. L. (1995). Auditor brand name reputations and industry specializations. *Journal of accounting and economics*, 20(3), 297-322. https://doi.org/10.1016/0165-4101(95)00403-3
- DeAngelo, L. E. (1981). Auditor size and audit quality. *Journal of accounting and economics*, *3*(3), 183-199. https://doi.org/10.1016/0165-4101(81)90002-1
- DeFond, M. L., & Jiambalvo, J. (1994). Debt covenant violation and manipulation of accruals. *Journal of accounting and economics*, 17(1-2), 145-176. https://doi.org/10.1016/0165-4101(94)90008-6
- Deis Jr, D. R., & Giroux, G. A. (1992). Determinants of audit quality in the public sector. *Accounting Review*, 462-479.
- Fitriany, F., Utama, S., Martani, D., & Rosietta, H. (2015). Pengaruh Tenure, Rotasi dan Spesialisasi Kantor Akuntan Publik (KAP) Terhadap Kualitas Audit: Perbandingan Sebelum dan Sesudah Regulasi Rotasi KAP di Indonesia. *Jurnal Akuntansi dan Keuangan*, 17(1), 12-27.
- Fitriany, S. U., Martani, D., & Rossieta, H. (2011). Do Mandatory Audit Firm and Audit Partner Rotation Really Improve Audit Quality. *Comparison between Pre and Post Regulation Period in Indonesia. Universitas Indonesia.*
- Francis, J. R., & Simon, D. T. (1987). A test of audit pricing in the small-client segment of the US audit market. *Accounting Review*, 145-157.
- Gietzmann, M. B., & Sen, P. K. (2002). Improving auditor independence through selective mandatory rotation. *International Journal of Auditing*, 6(2), 183-210.
- Hamid, A. (2013). Pengaruh Tenur KAP Dan Ukuran KAP Terhadap Kualitas Audit (Studi Empiris pada Perusahaan Manufaktur yang Terdaftar di BEI). *Jurnal akuntansi*, 1(1).
- Hamilton, J., Ruddock, C., Stokes, D. J., & Taylor, S. L. (2005). Audit partner rotation, earnings quality and earnings conservatism. *Earnings Quality and Earnings Conservatism (June 9, 2005)*.
- Hoyle, J. (1978). Mandatory auditor rotation: The arguments and an alternative. *Journal of Accountancy (pre-1986)*, 145(000005), 69.
- Imhoff, G. (2003). Accounting quality, auditing and corporate governance. *Auditing and Corporate Governance* (January 2003).
- Indonesia Capital Market Directory (ICMD) Tahun 2012, Indonesia Stock Exchange (IDX)
- Indonesia Capital Market Directory (ICMD) Tahun 2013, Indonesia Stock Exchange (IDX)
- Indonesia Capital Market Directory (ICMD) Tahun 2014, Indonesia Stock Exchange (IDX)
- Indonesia Capital Market Directory (ICMD) Tahun 2015, Indonesia Stock Exchange (IDX)
- Indonesia Capital Market Directory (ICMD) Tahun 2016, Indonesia Stock Exchange (IDX)
- Indonesia Capital Market Directory (ICMD) Tahun 2017, Indonesia Stock Exchange (IDX)
- Jones, J. J. (1991). Earnings management during import relief investigations. *Journal of accounting research*, 29(2), 193-228.
- Kirana, I. G. A. M. I., & Ramantha, I. W. (2020). The effect of auditor rotation, time pressure, and audit tenure on audit quality with auditor specialization as moderation variable. *International research journal of management, IT and social sciences*, 7(3), 126-136.
- Knapp, M. C. (1991). Factors that audit committee members use as surrogates for audit quality. *Auditing-A Journal of Practice & Theory*, *10*(1), 35-52.

- Komalasari, A. (2004). Analisis Pengaruh kualitas auditor dan proxy going concern terhadap opini auditor. *Jurnal Akuntansi dan keuangan*, 9(2), 1-15.
- Lai, K. W., & Gul, F. A. (2008). Was audit quality of Laventhol and Horwath poor?. *Journal of accounting and public policy*, *27*(3), 217-237. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaccpubpol.2008.02.002
- Lee, C.J., C. Liu, dan T. Wang. (1999). The 150-hour Rule. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*. 27(2), 203—228.
- Levinthal, D. A., & Fichman, M. (1988). Dynamics of interorganizational attachments: Auditor-client relationships. *Administrative science quarterly*, 345-369.
- Levinthal, D. A., & Fichman, M. (1991). *History dependence in professional relationships: Ties that bind* (No. 1991-33). Carnegie Mellon University, Tepper School of Business.
- Manry, D. L., Mock, T. J., & Turner, J. L. (2008). Does increased audit partner tenure reduce audit quality?. *Journal of Accounting, Auditing & Finance*, 23(4), 553-572.
- Mautz, R. K., & Sharaf, H. A. (1961). The Philosophy of Auditing, American Accounting Association. *Monograph No. 6. Sarasota, FL: American Accounting Association*.
- Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor 20 Tahun 2015 Tentang Praktik Akuntan Publik Bab V mengenai Pembatasan Jasa Audit pada Pasal 11
- Simmons, T. N., Costigan, M. L., & Lovata, L. M. (2009). Mandatory audit firm rotation: Evidence from Illinois state universities. *Academy of Accounting and Financial Studies Journal*, *13*(3), 123.
- Siregar, S., Fitriany, V. N. P., Wibowo, dan Anggraita A. (2009). Laporan Hibah Fakultas Ekonomi UI
- Skinner, D. J., & Srinivasan, S. (2012). Audit quality and auditor reputation: Evidence from Japan. *The Accounting Review*, 87(5), 1737-1765.
- St. Pierre, K., & Anderson, J. A. (1984). An analysis of the factors associated with lawsuits against public accountants. *Accounting Review*, 242-263.
- Vanstraelen, A. (2000). Impact of renewable long-term audit mandates on audit quality. *European Accounting Review*, 9(3), 419-442.
- Velury, U., & Jenkins, D. S. (2006). Institutional ownership and the quality of earnings. *Journal of Business Research*, 59(9), 1043-1051. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2006.05.001
- Wibowo, A., & Rossieta, H. (2009). Faktor-faktor determinasi kualitas audit–suatu studi dengan pendekatan earnings surprise benchmark. *Simposium Nasional Akuntansi*, 12, 1-34.
- Widiastuty, E., & Febrianto, R. (2010). Pengukuran Kualitas Audit: Sebuah Esai. *Jurnal Ilmiah Akuntansi dan Bisnis*, 5(2), 1-43.

#### **Biography of Authors**



Ni Made Puspa Pawitri is magister student in the Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Udayana, Denpasar, Indonesia. She was born in May 8, 1993. Email: puspapawitri@gmail.com



Ni Made Puspa Pawitri is magister student in the Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Udayana, Denpasar, Indonesia. She was born in May 8, 1993. Email: puspapawitri@gmail.com



Dr. Drs. Ketut Muliartha RM, M.M.,Ak.,CA.,CPA. is assistant professor in the Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Udayana, Denpasar, Indonesia. *Email: ketutmuliartha@unud.ac.id* 



Dr. I Nyoman Wijana Asmara Putra, S.E., M.Si., Ak. is assistant professor in the Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Udayana, Denpasar, Indonesia. Email: wijana\_putra@yahoo.co.id