The struggle to rescue Balinese culture from 'culture' is in danger of being self-defeating because it relies on an concept of culture-as-commodity which negates what it seeks to preserve. This recognition allows us to rethink Bali not as a culture, but as a brand.

Mark Hobart
“Bali is a Brand: A Critical Approach”

In this changing agricultural landscape, the subak is not what it used to be. It has changed and will be changing. The question is then how to adjust these changes to the UNESCO concept of the preservation of the world cultural heritage.

Saidi Yusahbibi
“The Balinese Subak as World Cultural Heritage in the Context of Tourism”

When we reconceptualize what is happening in Ubud in this way we need to ask whether “tourism” is really the most useful concept for thinking about it – or is it an obstacle to understanding what is happening? Might it be more useful to think of it something like “cosmopolitan economic/cultural development”?

Graeme Markoe
“Ubud: Buriara Terasula”

RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN BALI TOURISM
CULTURE, HERITAGE, AND LANDSCAPE IN AN OPEN FORTESS

Edited by
I Nyoman Darmo Putra and Sobhan Campbell
RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN BALI TOURISM
Culture, Heritage, and Landscape in an Open Fortress
©The Authors

Published by
Program Studi Magister Kajian Pariwisata Universitas Udayana
in cooperation with Buku Arti

Edited by
I Nyoman Darma Putra and Siobhan Campbell

Cover
Front : Made Artha
Back : Arba Wirawan
Design by Aryantha Soethama

First published, December 2015

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements v

Preface
Baliology: Where to From Here?
   Siobhan Campbell and I Nyoman Darma Putra vii

Representing Traditional Bali: Colonial Legacies and Current Problems
   Henk Schulte Nordholt 1

Bali is a Brand: A Critical Approach
   Mark Hobart 11

Balinese Identity as Tourist Attraction: From ‘Cultural Tourism’ to ‘Ajeg Bali’
   Michel Picard 39
Ubud: Benteng Terbuka
Graeme MacRae 69

Art and Tourism in Bali: Incompatible Partners?
Siobhan Campbell 80

Bali, Between Cultural and Marine Tourism
I Nyoman Darma Putra 101

The Balinese Subak as World Cultural Heritage: In the Context of Tourism
Shinji Yamashita 116

World Heritage and Bali’s Development Dilemmas
Carol Warren 145

Water, Tourism, and Social Change: A Discussion of Environmental Perceptions in Bali
Thomas Wright 170

Sustainable Tourism Discourse and Practice: A Case Study of Village-Ecotourism in Southern Bali
Hiroi Iwahara 193

Traditional Livelihoods and Community-Based Ecotourism: Alternative Development Paths?
Christian Byczek 214

Pain and Pleasure in the Open Fortress: Memorialising the Bali Bombings
Jeff Lewis, Belinda Lewis and I Nyoman Darma Putra 240
After the Kuta Bombing – In Search of the Balinese ‘Soul’  
With 2015 Postscript  
Jean Couteau  271

_Gema Perdamaian_: Tourism, Religion and Peace  
in Multicultural Bali  
Shinji Yamashita  310

Paradise Lost, Sanity Gained: Towards a Critical Balinese  
Urbanism  
Alexander Cuthbert  326

Concluding Remarks: Critical Studies of Tourism in Bali  
Adrian Vickers  369

Contributor and Editor  373  
Index  379
This publication presents a range of contemporary studies in ‘Baliology’ - or Balinese studies – which in recent years has been dominated by tourism-related studies. It is the outcome of an international seminar titled ‘Benteng Terbuka: The Future of Bali Tourism’, organised by the Masters Program in Tourism Studies, Postgraduate Program, Udayana University in June 2014. The seminar was not designed as a purely academic conference but as a gathering of international and national scholars with representatives of the provincial and national governments to discuss the complexities of Balinese tourism and culture in a practical sense.
On that occasion, the Governor of Bali Made Mangku Pastika presented a paper in which he highlighted the importance of tourism as a source of economic development, employment and cultural identity. He encouraged students to develop their skills and experience to give themselves a competitive advantage in obtaining jobs and positions within the tourism industry and other fields, emphasising that it was not enough to learn English, but that other widely spoken languages like Chinese should be acquired. His words were an acknowledgement that interaction with foreigners is fundamental to change in Balinese society, indicating that while the many challenges of tourism have long been recognised at an official level, the viewpoint has moved beyond simple questions of whether tourism enriches or degrades culture.

Two of the papers in this volume, by Professor Henk Schulte Nordholt and Dr. Graeme MacRae, were prepared specifically for presentation at the seminar. These two key contributions provoke historical reflection on questions of tourism development and identify a long trajectory for present questions about the relationships between tourism and culture. With strong credentials drawing on many years of experience in the field of Bali studies, most recently both authors have documented a kind of cultural crisis experienced by Bali, marked by questions about ethnic identity, the position of Bali within the Indonesian nation state and the flow of immigrants from other parts of Indonesia into the island. In this context, Schulte Nordholt described the island of Bali as an ‘open fortress’ (*benteng terbuka*), a description that has circulated widely and provoked considerable reflection, thus giving rise to the thematic title of the seminar.

Recognising that a number of other scholars have also conducted research relevant to the questions posed by the seminar, Professor Darma Putra subsequently approached the
additional contributors to this volume. While not all of these contributions relate in a direct sense to the theme of ‘benteng terbuka’, we felt that all were applicable to the questions posed by the seminar regarding the future of tourism. Moving beyond the question of whether tourism has a undesirable impact or otherwise on the island of Bali, all the contributions examine developments related to Balinese tourism through the analysis of specific tourism strategies or localities or by extensive discussion of legislation and policy making. A few of the papers have already been published in academic journals, however they have been included here in the interests of accessibility and because the questions they raise have implications that lie beyond specific case studies.

Collectively, this volume makes clear that questions of ‘sustainability’ in relation to Balinese tourism are now as much, if not more, related to the natural environment than they are to aspects of material and performing culture. As Carol Warren reveals in her contribution, this is in part related to Bali’s entanglement in international heritage schemes and conventions which accentuate the links between nature conservation and the preservation of cultural properties. Several authors discuss the deployment of the Balinese model of *Tri Hita Karana* in this context, a concept taken to encompass the interconnectivity of the divine, human and environmental domains. As Christian Byczek explains, this philosophy or ‘invented tradition’ is widely held to be a means of enabling the Balinese to adapt to globalisation, while conserving their identity, tradition and culture. Although we may, following Mark Hobart, choose to regard the extensive adoption of this philosophy as another
element in Bali’s successful ‘branding’ strategy, there is no doubt that the natural environment is now acknowledged widely in official and informal tourism strategies on the island. As Darma Putra points out, although cultural tourism has long been regarded as the mainstay of the island’s tourism industry there are good reasons to expand the widely-held definitions of cultural tourism to encompass the many activities that take place along Bali’s coastline, a space where nature, ritual and human activities are entwined. Many of the contributors also describe and refer to innovative forms of ecotourism - marketed as alternatives to mass tourism – that have emerged in response to perceived tourism saturation in the established tourist areas.

This volume follows on from several earlier publications in the field of Bali studies resulting from special conferences or studies. These include State and society in Bali: historical, textual and anthropological approaches (1991) edited by Hildred Geertz; Being Modern in Bali: Image and Change (1996) edited by Adrian Vickers; Staying Local in the Global Village: Bali in the Twentieth Century (1999) edited by Raechelle Rubinstein and Linda Connor; To Change Bali: essays in honour of I Gusti Ngurah Bagus (2000) edited by Adrian Vickers and I Nyoman Darma Putra with Michele Ford; and Inequality, crisis and social change in Indonesia: the muted worlds of Bali (2002) edited by Thomas A. Reuter. Additionally, other significant studies have explored and compared Bali to other ethnic groups, such as Between harmony and discrimination: negotiating religious identities within majority-minority relationships in Bali and Lombok (2014) edited by Brigitta Hauser-Schäublin and David D. Harnish. All these publications indicate the ongoing of scholarly tradition and regeneration in studies of Bali.

Given that it is over a decade since the publication of an edited volume dedicated entirely to Bali has appeared, we hope
that this volume will fill the gap and serve to demonstrate the ongoing level and extent of academic interest in this small island and generate further interchange between researchers of Bali. It is also important to recognise the dedicated academic journal *Jurnal Kajian Bali*, initiated by Udayana University in 2011, as an arena for the publication of area studies on Bali. We believe that the propensity of multidisciplinary approaches contained in this volume suggests that such approaches will be increasingly common in future.

Bearing in mind the longevity of Bali’s tourism industry, we felt that it was important to elicit contributions from younger scholars who have only recently begun their work in this field. However, in making room for younger scholars some of the most distinguished names in the field have been overlooked. In particular we recognise the sharp insights and analysis of our guru Adrian Vickers who contributed immensely the earlier collected volumes, and whose major publications include *A Paradise Created* (2012 [1989]) and *Paintings and Drawings of Bali 1800-2010* (2012). He is an inspiration to fellow colleagues and students alike and for this reason we are not only honoured, but feel it is fitting that Adrian has penned the closing remarks to this volume given his attention to studies or representations of Bali throughout his career. Just as Professor Dr I Gusti Ngurah Bagus (1933–2003) was an academic ‘father’ to many of Adrian’s generation and Hildred Geertz, a ‘mother’, today’s students of Balinese studies regard Adrian in extremely high esteem for his detailed appraisals and the staggering scope of his research. It is our hope that others will draw the same kind of inspiration from the investigations, discussions and analysis presented here.
# CONTENTS

Acknowledgements v

Preface
Baliology: Where to From Here?  
    **Siobhan Campbell and I Nyoman Darma Putra** vii

Representing Traditional Bali: Colonial Legacies and Current Problems  
    **Henk Schulte Nordholt** 1

Bali is a Brand: A Critical Approach  
    **Mark Hobart** 11

Balinese Identity as Tourist Attraction: From ‘Cultural Tourism’ to ‘Ajeg Bali’  
    **Michel Picard** 39
Ubud: Benteng Terbuka
  Graeme MacRae  69

Art and Tourism in Bali: Incompatible Partners?
  Siobhan Campbell  80

Bali, Between Cultural and Marine Tourism
  I Nyoman Darma Putra  101

The Balinese Subak as World Cultural Heritage: In the Context of Tourism
  Shinji Yamashita  116

World Heritage and Bali’s Development Dilemmas
  Carol Warren  145

Water, Tourism, and Social Change: A Discussion of Environmental Perceptions in Bali
  Thomas Wright  170

Sustainable Tourism Discourse and Practice: A Case Study of Village-Ecotourism in Southern Bali
  Hiroi Iwahara  193

Traditional Livelihoods and Community-Based Ecotourism: Alternative Development Paths?
  Christian Byczek  214

Pain and Pleasure in the Open Fortress: Memorialising the Bali Bombings
  Jeff Lewis, Belinda Lewis and I Nyoman Darma Putra  240
### CONTENTS

After the Kuta Bombing – In Search of the Balinese ‘Soul’
With 2015 Postscript

Jean Couteau 271

*Gema Perdamaian: Tourism, Religion and Peace*

in Multicultural Bali

Shinji Yamashita 310

Paradise Lost, Sanity Gained: Towards a Critical Balinese Urbanism

Alexander Cuthbert 326

Concluding Remarks: Critical Studies of Tourism in Bali

Adrian Vickers 369

Contributor and Editor 373

Index 379
Preface

Baliology: Where to From Here?

Siobhan Campbell
and I Nyoman Darma Putra

This publication presents a range of contemporary studies in ‘Baliology’ - or Balinese studies – which in recent years has been dominated by tourism-related studies. It is the outcome of an international seminar titled ‘Benteng Terbuka: The Future of Bali Tourism’, organised by the Masters Program in Tourism Studies, Postgraduate Program, Udayana University in June 2014. The seminar was not designed as a purely academic conference but as a gathering of international and national scholars with representatives of the provincial and national governments to discuss the complexities of Balinese tourism and culture in a practical sense.
On that occasion, the Governor of Bali Made Mangku Pastika presented a paper in which he highlighted the importance of tourism as a source of economic development, employment and cultural identity. He encouraged students to develop their skills and experience to give themselves a competitive advantage in obtaining jobs and positions within the tourism industry and other fields, emphasising that it was not enough to learn English, but that other widely spoken languages like Chinese should be acquired. His words were an acknowledgement that interaction with foreigners is fundamental to change in Balinese society, indicating that while the many challenges of tourism have long been recognised at an official level, the viewpoint has moved beyond simple questions of whether tourism enriches or degrades culture.

Two of the papers in this volume, by Professor Henk Schulte Nordholt and Dr. Graeme MacRae, were prepared specifically for presentation at the seminar. These two key contributions provoke historical reflection on questions of tourism development and identify a long trajectory for present questions about the relationships between tourism and culture. With strong credentials drawing on many years of experience in the field of Bali studies, most recently both authors have documented a kind of cultural crisis experienced by Bali, marked by questions about ethnic identity, the position of Bali within the Indonesian nation state and the flow of immigrants from other parts of Indonesia into the island. In this context, Schulte Nordholt described the island of Bali as an ‘open fortress’ (*benteng terbuka*), a description that has circulated widely and provoked considerable reflection, thus giving rise to the thematic title of the seminar.

Recognising that a number of other scholars have also conducted research relevant to the questions posed by the seminar, Professor Darma Putra subsequently approached the
additional contributors to this volume. While not all of these contributions relate in a direct sense to the theme of ‘benteng terbuka’, we felt that all were applicable to the questions posed by the seminar regarding the future of tourism. Moving beyond the question of whether tourism has a undesirable impact or otherwise on the island of Bali, all the contributions examine developments related to Balinese tourism through the analysis of specific tourism strategies or localities or by extensive discussion of legislation and policy making. A few of the papers have already been published in academic journals, however they have been included here in the interests of accessibility and because the questions they raise have implications that lie beyond specific case studies.

Collectively, this volume makes clear that questions of ‘sustainability’ in relation to Balinese tourism are now as much, if not more, related to the natural environment than they are to aspects of material and performing culture. As Carol Warren reveals in her contribution, this is in part related to Bali’s entanglement in international heritage schemes and conventions which accentuate the links between nature conservation and the preservation of cultural properties. Several authors discuss the deployment of the Balinese model of *Tri Hita Karana* in this context, a concept taken to encompass the interconnectivity of the divine, human and environmental domains. As Christian Byczek explains, this philosophy or ‘invented tradition’ is widely held to be a means of enabling the Balinese to adapt to globalisation, while conserving their identity, tradition and culture. Although we may, following Mark Hobart, choose to regard the extensive adoption of this philosophy as another
element in Bali’s successful ‘branding’ strategy, there is no doubt that the natural environment is now acknowledged widely in official and informal tourism strategies on the island. As Darma Putra points out, although cultural tourism has long been regarded as the mainstay of the island’s tourism industry there are good reasons to expand the widely-held definitions of cultural tourism to encompass the many activities that take place along Bali’s coastline, a space where nature, ritual and human activities are entwined. Many of the contributors also describe and refer to innovative forms of ecotourism - marketed as alternatives to mass tourism – that have emerged in response to perceived tourism saturation in the established tourist areas.

This volume follows on from several earlier publications in the field of Bali studies resulting from special conferences or studies. These include State and society in Bali: historical, textual and anthropological approaches (1991) edited by Hildred Geertz; Being Modern in Bali: Image and Change (1996) edited by Adrian Vickers; Staying Local in the Global Village: Bali in the Twentieth Century (1999) edited by Raechelle Rubinstein and Linda Connor; To Change Bali: essays in honour of I Gusti Ngurah Bagus (2000) edited by Adrian Vickers and I Nyoman Darma Putra with Michele Ford; and Inequality, crisis and social change in Indonesia: the muted worlds of Bali (2002) edited by Thomas A. Reuter. Additionally, other significant studies have explored and compared Bali to other ethnic groups, such as Between harmony and discrimination: negotiating religious identities within majority-minority relationships in Bali and Lombok (2014) edited by Brigitta Hauser-Schäublin and David D. Harnish. All these publications indicate the ongoing of scholarly tradition and regeneration in studies of Bali.

Given that it is over a decade since the publication of an edited volume dedicated entirely to Bali has appeared, we hope
that this volume will fill the gap and serve to demonstrate the ongoing level and extent of academic interest in this small island and generate further interchange between researchers of Bali. It is also important to recognise the dedicated academic journal *Jurnal Kajian Bali*, initiated by Udayana University in 2011, as an arena for the publication of area studies on Bali. We believe that the propensity of multidisciplinary approaches contained in this volume suggests that such approaches will be increasingly common in future.

Bearing in mind the longevity of Bali’s tourism industry, we felt that it was important to elicit contributions from younger scholars who have only recently begun their work in this field. However, in making room for younger scholars some of the most distinguished names in the field have been overlooked. In particular we recognise the sharp insights and analysis of our guru Adrian Vickers who contributed immensely the earlier collected volumes, and whose major publications include *A Paradise Created* (2012 [1989]) and *Paintings and Drawings of Bali 1800-2010* (2012). He is an inspiration to fellow colleagues and students alike and for this reason we are not only honoured, but feel it is fitting that Adrian has penned the closing remarks to this volume given his attention to studies or representations of Bali throughout his career. Just as Professor Dr I Gusti Ngurah Bagus (1933–2003) was an academic ‘father’ to many of Adrian’s generation and Hildred Geertz, a ‘mother’, today’s students of Balinese studies regard Adrian in extremely high esteem for his detailed appraisals and the staggering scope of his research. It is our hope that others will draw the same kind of inspiration from the investigations, discussions and analysis presented here.