## POWER RELATIONS IN THE PRACTICE OF HINDU "INVENTED RELIGION" IN BALI<sup>\*</sup>

By Nyoman Wijaya<sup>©</sup>

The purpose of this study is to discuss the relations of power in the history of the contemporary Hindu religion in Bali. The concept of power relations refers to the concept of Power and Discourse of Michel Foucault, while the term "invented religion" is a development of Invented Tradition by Eric Hobsbawm. Therefore, "invented religion" in this study is defined as the practice of Hindu religion, which was invented, constructed, and officially manifested; and the religious practice which emerged in a relatively short time; and in a few years it has been regarded as an established religion. Based on the concept of Power and Discourse of Michel Foucault, I argue that there are relations of power that shape and sustain the practice of "invented religion." I will try to find the power relations in a God worshipping discourse in Samuan Tiga and Jagatnata temples. There are two research questions that I raise the argument, namely how and why these two discourses emerge and thrive in for contemporary's practice of Hinduism? The answer to both questions will be sought at the present organic intellectual thought. Then, it is assessed using the Genealogy Method of Michel Foucault. My conclusion is that the presence of the two discourses is only to harmonize Hinduism with Islam as the majority religion in Indonesia.

Key Word: the relations of power, invented religion, power and discourse, and organic intellectual.

## Introduction

Generally the Bali Hindu community worships the ancestral spirits, which they refer to as *batara*. But on the other hand there is also a direct worship to the God. There are two ways of worshiping God, namely, that the God in His manifestation as Trimurti, and the other as Sang Hyang Tunggal. These are two opposing discourses. Trimurti is God in the form of Brahma, Vishnu, and Shiva, while Sang Hyang Tunggal is in the form of God as the Almighty, as written in the first principle of the Pancasila.

The practice of worshiping God in His manifestation as Trimurti can be seen in the Samuantiga Temple. A number of organic intellectuals convinced that The Pura Samuantiga was built in the tenth century, during the reign of Darmapriya Guna Patni and her consort, Udayana as King of Bali. Samuantiga Tempe in the beginning was the venue for conference of religious leaders to resolve sect issues in Bali. Deliberation has managed to bring together 11 religious sects into three, namely, the religions that worship the gods Brahma, Vishnu, and

<sup>\*</sup> This Paper was originally presented in Cosmopolis Conference, Yogyakarta 20 to 22 June 2014. Thanks to Prof. Dr. Bambang Purwanto, MA, which who has given me the opportunity to appear as a presenter at the conference. Thanks to Nyoman Udayana Ph.D. and Dr. Komang Seri Malini who has been correct and improve the English of this manuscript.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>©</sup> Historian of Udayana University, Bachelor, Master, and PhD Alumnus of Gadjah Mada University, Yogyakarta. Contact address: iwijasyastsp@yahoo.co.id

Shiva, called Trimurti. The successful implementation of these deliberations cannot be separated from the role of Mpu Kuturan.<sup>1</sup>



The Pura Samuan Tiga, at Gianyar Regency. Taken from : Google.com

While the practice of worshipping God in His form as Sang Hyang Tunggal can be seen in Jagatnata Temple. A number of organic intellectuals today said that the Jagatnata temple was originally established in Denpasar in the 1970s, then followed by other districts. At first Jagatnata Temple was built on the basis of consideration that newcomers who are not members of the indigenous village in Denpasar have a place of worship.



JThe Jagatnata Temple at Denpasar City . Taken from Google.com

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See further, "Sejarah Pura Samuantiga," babadbali.com. Rabu, 24 Oktober 2012, download via http://www. google.co.id 15 May 2014.

That's because all the temples in Bali, except Besakih, is a place to pray for the local population as conceptualized by Mpu Kuturan through Pura Kahyangan Tiga. However, developing into the temple which was seemingly built by the local government, so that it not only serves as a place of worhip for migrants, but also for the public, especially the civil servants and students.<sup>2</sup>



The Besakih Temple at Karangasem Regency. Taken from Google.com

In the Jagatnata Temple there is a shrine called Palinggih Padmasana, which is home to the God in vertical concepts embodied in Tripurusha, including Shiva, Sadashiva, and Paramashiva.<sup>3</sup>



The Padmasana Altar in The, Jagatnata Temple at Denpasar City. Taken from Google com.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> "Pura Jagatnata," Stiti Dhrama Online, download via http://www. google.co.id 15 May 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Sang Hyang Tripurusha means God as the great soul of the universe, which includes *Bhur Loka* called Shiva (God in the soul of nature under), *Bhuwah* called Sada Shiva (God in the soul of nature middle), called *Swah* Swah Loka Loka (God in the soul of nature above). God in this concept is placed on the Padmatiga shrine at Besakih Temple. I Ketut Gobyah, "Memuja Batara Tri Purusa," *Bali Post Online*, 3 January 2007, download via http://www.google.co.id 15 May 2014.

While God in a horizontal concept embodied in the Trimurti, i.e. Brahma, Vishnu, and Shiva are not in the Jagatnata. Based on this, a number of organic intellectuals proposed building a shrine for worsipping Trimurti in the form of Batara Hyang Guru in Jagatnata Temple so that there is a balance between the vertical and horizontal concept.<sup>4</sup> It is also necessary to think about the existence of a grave for newcomers, such as the one found in Kayubuntil Grave in Singaraja (Indigenous Village Buleleng).<sup>5</sup>



The Jagatnata Temple at Singaraja Regency. Taken From Google.com

Based on the above description, there are two interesting issues to be studied, namely, first, in the 10th century in Bali there was a conflict between the 11 religious sects. The conflict can be resolved by way of melting them into three religious sects called Trimurti. The manifestation of God as Trimurti is worshiped in the Samuan Tiga Temple. Second, in the 1970s there was awareness to respect the rights of migrants to pray to God in Denpasar, therefore, a temple called Jagatnata Temple was built. This temple is a place of worship of God in the concept of Sang Hyang Tunggal or Almighty God as understood in the first principle of Pancasila. Thus, both the concept of Trimurti and Sang Hyang Tunggal (God Almighty) are formed solely for satysfying the internal inteest of Hindus in Bali.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Mpu Kuturan made the concept of worship to Sang Hyang Tunggal (God Almighty). The concept is then used to create a symbol Tapak Dara, which is a meeting between a horizontal line above the bottom line into the '+'. Tapak Dara is a symbol of *Lingga* and *Yoni*, as the worship of Buddhist Ciwa in Bali. Lingga is described as the phallus, while Yoni is the the base Lingga symbolizing the female genital (vagina). The horizontal line is a Buddhist symbol and the vertical is the Shiva symbol. Horizontal line is known as the Trimurti, while the vertical is called Tripurusha. Trimurti is a symbol of Brahma, Vishnu, Iswara (Buddha) which is placed on the Rong Telu shrine, while Tripurusha is Shiva, Sadashiva, Paramashiva placed on the Padmasana shrine. See further, "Ciwa-Budha-Konsep Dasar," Bali Spiritual Center, Paguyuban Dharma Giri Utama, Friday 24th August 2009, download via http://www.google.co.id 15th May 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> "Pura Jagatnata," Stiti Dhrama Online, download via http://www. google.co.id 15 May 2014.



The Sanghyang Tunggal God Almighty) symbols in the Puppet. Taken from Google.com

The above issues will be studied by using the genealogy method of Michel Foucault's.<sup>6</sup> In this method, it ismentioned that historical facts are never neutral, because it is tied to the hidden values to provide a particular benefit to its proponents. Therefore, history should have been suspected as it is full of misleading things. To find such falsehood, then history must be dug up or dismantled.<sup>7</sup> Based on this method, the main problem in this study are translated into two research questions. First, whether the God worshipping discourse in the Trimurti concept today is a continuation of a similar worshipping practices in the past? Second, why the concepts of God worshipping discourse for Sang Hyang Tunggal (Almighty God) are able to emerge and thrive in the worshipping practice of Hindu today?

The sources used to answer the second questions above were sought and found in various writings or opinions of the organic intellectual<sup>8</sup> by using tools such as the theory of Discourse and Power of Michel Foucult. In this theory, it ismentioned, that in every discourse there is an intertwined relationship between the expression of discourse, underlying knowledge, and power relations that operate behind it. Each discourse fuses with operating

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Richard.J. Evans, In Defence of History (London: Granta Book, 1997), p. 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Moeflich Hasbullah, "Konstruksi Pemikiran Michel Foucault Tentang Sejarah," download via http://www.google.co.id/ tanggal 19 Oktober 2012

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> The term of the organic intellectual refers to the concept of Antonio Gramsci. He divides intellectuals into two groups, namely the traditional and organic. Organic intellectual is a person whose activities in the community are associated with the productive and political structures of society, especially the group or class they represent. Meanwhile, traditional intellectuals are all the people who showintellectuality activity. See further, Antonio Gramsci, *Slection From The Prison Notebooks*, edited and translated by Quintin Hoare and Geoffrey Nowell Smith (New York: International Publisher, 1971), p. 5, 9, and 12.

power behind it; and also it cannot be separated from the power relations hidden behind it, which is a product of the exercise of power. The nature of power in Michel Foucault's theory is not centralized, but plural, which grows from the various peripherals space, and present everywhere.<sup>9</sup>

Based on the theory of Discourse and Power of Michel Foucult, it appears an assumption that the discourse of organic intellectual about the emergence of the concept of the Trimurti in the tenth century and Sang Hyang Tunggal (God Almighty) in the 20th century contains power relations. Such assumptions are based on historical discrepancies, because if it is true that Shiva Buddhist religion in Bali is described as a meeting between vertical and horizontal lines into *Tapak Dara* symbolized by the sign '+',<sup>10</sup> then why did the events happen in a span of 7 centuries? Therefore, it can be said that there is a group of organic intellectuals who have captured a knowledge hidden behind a large discourse expression to be used as a power in the interests of the groups they represent, the Hindus. What was that discourse? The answer to this question will be sought to put Hinduism in Bali in the context of national history in the decade of the 1950s, especially in its relation to Islam and Christianity.

By letting the facts speak for what it is, as described above, then it means that the theory of Discourse and Power of Michel Foucult has been modified, because he never once advocated to seek power relations in the group of organic intellectuals. Foucault does not seek power relations on the power of repressive political structures, master and servant, the government, and the dominant social class. He paid attention to the mechanism and power strategies. He does not talk about what power is, but how power is practiced, accepted, and seen as truth.<sup>11</sup>

Foucault sought power in the most difficult places, such as on the performance of the feelings, love, awareness, observation of doctors, and the changes that have broad impact in the fields of science such as biology and linguistics. Power does not reflect the class (bourgeoisie) or the ruling elite and their attributes. According to Foucault power is a strategy that is caused by the function (dispositions, maneuvers, tactics, and techniques). Power is not derived from economic or political, because he has no basis. It survives as a complex network which is not limited to micro power nor of relationships that permeate every aspect of social life. Power not only oppresses, but also creates; <sup>12</sup> and is created by the power of truth, because he also had legitimacy. In other words, power is not just something that forces,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> See further, Yasraf Amir Piliang, *Dunia Yang Dilipat, Tamasya Melampaui Batas-Batas Kebudayaan* (Yogyakarta: Jalasutra, 2004), p. 223.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Refer back to footnote number 4 of this paper.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> See further, Konrad Kebung, "Kembalinya Moral Melalui Seks," Basis, No. 01 – 02, Tahun Ke- 51, Januari-Februari 2002, p. 34.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> See further, Michel Foucault, *Power/Knowledge*, Colin Gordon, ed., trans. Colin Gordon, Leo Marshall, John Mepham, Kate Soper (Sussex: The Harvester Press, 1980), p. 114.

censor, exploit, cover up, and conceal, but also productive, generating reality, the domain objects and rituals of independence.<sup>13</sup>

Based on the theoretical framework and concepts, initial steps were taken in this study is to investigate the discourses of religious practice during the Ancient Bali, so the first research question can be answered. If it cannot be proved in the present concept of Trimurti, it is a continuation of a similar worship practices in the past, then for a while it can be said that discourse is a practice of "invented religion." The same is done for the second research question.

### Trimurti Exploration to the Ancient Kingdom of Bali period

According to Goris, The King of Bali who was conquered by the forces of Majapahit Kingdom was Bhatâra Çri Asta-asura Ratna Bhûmi Banten.<sup>14</sup> But Pandit Shastri did not agree with that opinion. According to Shastri, the last king of Bali who could be defeated by Majapahit Kingdom was Bhatâra Çri Asta-sura Ratna Bhûmi Banten, which means a god incarnates a son on the island of Bali.<sup>15</sup> The name was inscribed on a statue at the Pura Tegeh Koripan temple located in Gunung Penulisan. It is mentioned in these statues, that Çri Asta-sura Ratna Bhûmi Banten took over as a king in 1329.<sup>16</sup>

Gora Sirikan argued that Çri Asta-sura Ratna Bhûmi Banten is a descendant of the Warmadewa dynasty. This king established a hermitage for a royal advisor named Mpu Dangudhyaya Kangka. The hermitage was named Temple Bahun located on the slopes of Mount Agung. The king also established a number of houses for the Shiva monks, among others, in the Air Garuda, Air Gajah, and Antakunyarapada (Rantakunyarapada). The king also established a home for the Buddhist clergy, among others, in Bajraçikhara, Buruan, and Canggini.<sup>17</sup>

Previously, in 1300 Bali was under the reign of King Kebo Parud. The king followed Vajrayana religion, namely Buddhism of Tantrismschool. The existence of this religion has got recognition when Bali was under the reign of King Jaya Çakti who reigned from 1133 to 1155. The religion Vajrayana was highly skewed in sorcery or witchcraft. The supreme leader of this school was king Singhasari, Krtanegara, who often performed ceremonial activities concerning Vajrayana religion.<sup>18</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> See further, Simon Philpott, *Meruntuhkan Indonesia: Politik Postkolonial dan Otoritarianisme*, trans. Nuruddin Mhd. Ali, Uzair Fauzan (Yogyakarta: LKIS, 2003), p. 22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> See further, R. Goris, *Sejarah Bali Kuno* (Singaraja: without the name of the publisher, October-November 1948), p. 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> See further N.D. Pandit Shastri, *Sejarah Bali Dwipa Djilid I* (Denpasar : Bhuva Saraswati, 1963), p.80.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Gora Sirikan, *Pulau Bali dalam Masa-Masa yang Lampau*, I edition (manuscripts, 1956), pp. 125-126.
 <sup>17</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 126.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> N.D. Pandit Shastri, op. cit., p. 77.

Exercises and Tantric ritual in Bali were revealed in Kebo Edan statues at Pura, Pejeng village, Gianyar.<sup>19</sup> According to Pandit Shastri, Vajrayana religious exercis wereconducted by royal officials Singhasari.<sup>20</sup> Although Kebo Parud followed Vajrayana, but he respected Shiva religion by establishing a vihara, a dormitory for Shiva monks, named Ratna Kunnyarapada. This King was also doing something similar to Buddhism by building houses for Buddhist monks in Luwing Gajah, Bedaulu. The presence of Buddhist monks had led to a rivalry between Buddhists and Shivas.<sup>21</sup>

Going furtherdown again, when Bali was conquered by the King of the Singhasari Kingdom Krtanegara in 1284, Buddhism evolved into Warnamarga or leftist school, which is generally called Tantric Buddhism.<sup>22</sup> Previously, in 1204 Bali was under the reign of King Çri Dhanâdhirâja and his wife Bhatâra Çri Dhanadewi. In the reign of the king, Bali had held ceremonies in any temple in the village area. It is also mentioned there was a temple named " Hyang Wukir," which served as a place of worship for the local people. Also found was a painting depicting Bhatara Guru with four hands.<sup>23</sup> There was also the ceremony in Magha Mahanawami in Hyang Wukir temple in Gunung. The ceremony took place very festively.<sup>24</sup>

Further down again, in 1119 - 1115 it was reported there was a case involving Air Tabar villagers with Indrapura hermitage. The Air Tabar villagers appealed to the king so that they were exempt from the task of contributing to the hermitage Indrapura, because they already had a duty to perform the ceremony on the Betari Bukit Tunggal. The king granted the request, but with the proviso that they had to pay taxes to the government. The issue was actually used as a decision by King Raja Çri Maharaja Wijaya Mahadewi in 983 and 914 at the time of Singha Mandawa.<sup>25</sup>

In 1181 the population of Batur and Cempaga made a request to the king in order to be allowed to move from its original faith worshipping Ganapati Tumpak Hyang switching to the gods on Mount Batur. This request was granted by the king. In order to maintain the authority of Ganapati, the king freed the worshipers of the gods from the obligation to pay taxes, they were only asked to contribute to the Dharma Anyar hermitage. In the past this village might be located near Kintamani, but now it includes the Bangli area.<sup>26</sup>

In this period there was also a hermitage Ratna Kunyarapada. The name was similar to the Hermitage Kunyara Anta which was found in Lutungan inscriptions in 1071.<sup>27</sup> Shastri

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> I Gusti Ayu Surasmi, Jejak Tantrayana di Bali (Denpasar: Bali Media Adhikarsa, 2007), p. 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> N.D. Pandit Shastri, op. cit., pp. 77-78.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Sartono Kartodirdjo, *et al.*, *Sejarah Nasional Indonesia, I editionI*, (Jakarta: Departement of Education and Culture, 1975), p. 256.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> *Ibid*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> N.D. Pandit Shastri, op. cit., p. 76.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 37.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 57-58.

equated the meaning of Anta Kunyara with Ratna Kunyarapada. The dorm served as the memories of the Kunyara Kuya Maharishi Agastya dorm which is located in Mysore, South India.<sup>28</sup>

In the 1177 - 1155 King Ragajaya already used law books "Uttara Widdhi Balawan" and "King of Discourse" (Niti Raja) as a guide in running the government of his kingdom. The book was also used by previous kings, such as Sakalendu Kirana who ruled Bali in 1099. Previously, during the reign of king Ragajaya, Shiva and Buddha religion well developed throughout Bali.<sup>29</sup> At that time, especially during the reign of King Jayapangus already mentioned about the regulations regarding deaths caused by *salah pati* (unnatural death). The regulation is still adhered to by the Hindu community in Bali until the present time. In that period it had also mentioned about public beliefs in the rural mountainous areas, which were often at variance with the beliefs of the Brahmins and kings in mainland Bali.<sup>30</sup>

In an inscription written in 1150 stated that there was a hermitage named Temple Bahung located on the slopes of Mount Agung. <sup>31</sup> These inscriptions also mentioned about the king's decision regarding a problem that occurred in Bantiran village. It was also mentioned in the inscription the name of the title of king Sira Prabhu Saksat Harimurti Jagadhita Karana, <sup>32</sup> thus it further reinforced the fact that King Jaya Çakti followed Vishnuism, as seen from Harimurti word meaning god Murti or god Vishnu.

More down again, in the year 1133 - 1150 Bali was ruled by King Çri Maharaja Jaya Çakti, who followed Vishnuism, as could be seen from the title Sira Saksatnira Vishnu Murti Prabhu Muktyasa. The king issued an inscription that mentioned the name of the village Kedisan, Bwahan, and Air Tabar, which were located around Lake Batur. It also added the name of Sirang KeShivan Mpung Kweng Dharma Anyar. The term Dharma Anyar was encountered in previous times in the inscriptions issued by King Jaya Pangus and it was mentioned also in the days of King Anak Wungsu.<sup>33</sup>

The facts above showed that king Jaya Çakti even followed Vishnuism, but he still respectedShivaism. It was revealed from the mention of the term Dharma Anyar which was a concept of Vishnu religion. <sup>34</sup> King Jaya Çakti also respected and Vajrayana Buddhism (Buddhist of Tatraism school). This could be seen from the inclusion of the two religious leaders to attend a hearing that would decide the rules on *salah pati* (unnatural death) in three villages. <sup>35</sup>

<sup>35</sup> Ibid.

 $<sup>^{28}</sup>$  Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Sartono Kartodirdjo, et al., op. cit., p. 151.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> N.D. Pandit Shastri, op. cit., p. 73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 102.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 71

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 70.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> In the year 1061 inscription Anak Wungsu also reported Dharma Anyar was an ascetic Shiva, the burial place of a priest named Shiva Jiwaya, *Ibid*.

More down again, in 1119 Bali was under the reign of King Çri Çûrâdhipa who embraced Vishnuism. It was revealed from the title name of Çri Prabhu Sakti Wisnu Murti Jagat Palaka Sakala Candra Ditya. In the inscription made by the king mentioned about a case that happened at the Hermitage Sukamerta. Previously, these issues actually were solved by King Aji Tawanendra Warmadewa ruling in Bali in 1077. In this period, Balinese kings were getting far left Shiva-Buddhist conception of religion.

Furthermore, even lower, in the year 1101 -1088<sup>36</sup> two statues were found, namely Harini and Parvati. Arca Hariti contained the words "I Betara Banyu Pelasa," whereas in the Parvati statue, it wascarved the inscription "Sang ring Guha."<sup>37</sup> Of the text, it can be interpreted that the king was once imprisoned in a cave and after death the ashes were buried on the banks of the river Plasa. Suppose the two statues are a symbol of the greatness of the kingdom, it could be said that the religion of the king was Indra and Shiva, because Hariti is equal to Indra, while Parvati is the embodiment of power (çakti) of Shiva. Nevertheless Shiva was the dominant religion, whereas Buddhism continued to decline.

In the inscription, written in 1098, it wasmentioned the name of Her Majesty Çri Maharaja Gon Karunia Pwa Swabhawa Çri Saksatnira Harimurti Jagatpalaka Nityasa. Harimurti means reincarnation of Vishnu. In *sapatha* (oath) this inscription mentioned the name of Rsi Agastya and the name of the gods in the Hindu religion. None mentioned the names associated with Buddhism. <sup>38</sup> Thus, it can be said that this king is an adherent of the religion of Vishnu, but also in honor of Shiva-Indra.

Beneath it again, in the year 1088 - 1079 Bali was under the authority of Maharaja Çri Walaprabhu, <sup>39</sup> a religious follower of Vishnu. This is evident in the sound inscriptions issued by the kings, namely, "Tekyaen pwa paduka Çri maharaja wisnu murni saksat jagat palaka." Vishnu religious doctrines have evolved in the time of King Marakata ruling in Bali in the year 1022-1026. This belief is followed by King Airlangga, as is evident from the use of the emblem, which is an eagle. <sup>40</sup>

Thus, the year 1022-1026 was a process of trasnsformation from religion to Shiva religion to Vishnu religion. The glory of Vishnu devotees refer to themselves as the Waesnawa. The community is divided into two groups namely Bhagawata and Pancarata. Both are now no longer in Bali, but the remnants can still be traced, because the glory of his teachings are still maintained by *Sengguhu* groups. Although they were regarded as a lower class, but they were given a special assignment in which they were required to lead and participate in religious ceremonies to enhance the public interest, which was held on a large

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Ibid., p. 68.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 69-70.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Ibid., p. 88.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Ibid..

scale. While doing the worship, they use the coat of arms of Vishnu, such as the conch shell as *çangka* called *sungu*, *gantha* (*wajra*), and chakras. Their worship is directed to the bottom of the earth which was the residence of supernatural beings supporting world. <sup>41</sup>

More down again, there is still a plenty of evidence of religious life in pre powers of Majapahit in Bali which showed the relationship between religion, Shiva and Buddha. Cooperation between Shiva and Buddha revealed was in an inscription written in the year 1001. In this inscription, it wasmentioned the king commissioned the Shiva-Buddhist priest and Senapati Kuturan to investigate the circumstances of the villagers in the Air Tewang. Problems faced by residents in the village was not associated with the cult of conflict, but rather a matter of the soil. <sup>42</sup>

The above inscription was issued by King Çri Gunapriyadarmapatni and Çri Dharmodayana Warmadewa ruling in Bali from year 984 to the year 1001. The period is called by the organic intellectual in the present as a time of conflict cult that later produced the concept of Trimurti. <sup>43</sup> The concept was not ever mentioned in the inscriptions issued by King Gunapriyadarmapatni and Çri Dharmodayana Warmadewa.

In the inscription, written in 989, it was mentioned that Çri Gunapriyadharmapatni and Çri Dharmodayana Warmadewa gives grace to the residents in the Bharu village. <sup>44</sup> In the Serai inscription written in 993, for example, included a mention of Mpu Sogata (Buddhist monks). It was also mentioned in the inscription about a Buddhist monk who came from Nalanda (India). There was also news about Canggini temple, called Pura Sekah near the Blahbatuh village, and also on the Air Gangga Hermitage and Bajra Çikhara. <sup>45</sup>

In the inscriptions found in the Buahan village there was mentioned about people's obligation to pay contributions that were used for the benefit of Pura Hyang Api (Agni Çala).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Gora Sirikan, op. cit., p, 42.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> See further N. D. Pandit Shastri, op. cit., pp. 46-47.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Here is another example (more complete) than the organic intellectual discourse today while making the story's history during the reign of Cri Gunapriyadarmapatni and Cri Dharmodayana Warmadewa. They argue that during the reign of the population adheres to Balinese 9 different religious beliefs, namely Shiva, Khala, Brahma, Vishnu, Bayu, Iswara, Bhairawa, Ghanapatya, and Buddhist. Each group practice their respective beliefs. Because there was an unrest in the community. Security and order were disrupted. To overcome these problems, the king then invited the relatives of Sang Catur Sanak (four of five siblings pastor's son Mpu Lampita) in East Java in order to come to Bali. One of them named Mpu Kuturan. The king then ordered Mpu Kuturan to resolve the issue. On the basis of these orders Mpu Kuturan held a meeting attended by representatives from the faith groups. The meeting resulted in six decisions. First, Trimurti serve as the basis of religion because everyone already understands its meaning and is a cult that has developed in Bali. Second, in every village customs (Pakraman) founded "Pura Khayangan Tiga," which includes, (i) the Pura Bale Agung or village temple as a place of worship of Brahma; (ii) Puseh temple for the worship of Vishnu; and (iii) the Dalem temple to glorify his magic Shiva and Goddess Durga as the return of the *five great elements* Butha (unsur panca maha butha-pralina). Third, in the fields established Pura Subak. Fourth, in every house there is a shrine mandatory Rong Tiga (Rong Telu) as a place to glorify and worship the holy spirits of the ancestors and Sanghyang Widhi Wasa (God). Fifth, all garden (pekarangan) soil, the soil in a region Pakraman, and on the ground in the temple are the property Khayangan Tiga indigenous villages. sixth, the religion professed by the people of Bali called Siva religion - Buddhism. See further, "Mpu Kuturan di Balik Desa Pekraman dan Penganut Agama Ciwa-Budha di Bali," Selasa, 12 November 201, Dwi Tumpeng Blog, , download via http://www. google.co.id 15 May 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Gora Sirikan, *op. cit.*, p. 72.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> N.D. Pandit Shastri, op. cit., p. 46.

On the feast day of Magha Mahanawami the villagers were required to provide fish caught from the lake. It was also mentioned in the inscription that they were exempt from the obligation to maintain Uma Pura Sang Hyang in Trunyan. This inscription also mentions Aji Ing Krama, a court hall, the venue for the trial, which was attended by monks Sogata (Buddha), Upadhayaya Ing Nalanda (India), Dang Açary Ing Waranasi (India), Dang Açary Widyaka Sanghyang Api (Agni Çala), and class of Shiva.<sup>46</sup>

Based on the above description, it can be said that during the reign of King Çri Gunapriyadarmapatni and Çri Dharmodayana Warmadewa, there began an amalgamation or a blend of Buddhism and Shiva religions. This fact further strengthens the evidence that Çri Gunapriyadarmapatni was an adherent of the a Shiva religion, a Shiva and Çri Dharmodayana Warmadewa a Buddhist. The two religions are very difficult indeed to get united, because they have a very essential difference, there are concerns about whether or not God exists.

If dug deeper, before the reign of King Çri Gunapriyadarmapatni and Çri Dharmodayana Warmadewa, there was an inscription written in the year 983 by King Wijaya-Mahadewi. This inscription was found in the village Gobleg. In the inscriptions written a sentence that reads "ida hyang buktunggal in banua tabar in water,"which means to worship in Bukit Tunggal located in Bukit Tabar." This king is assumed to rule in Bali until the year 988.<sup>47</sup>

More down again, in the Sembiran inscription which dates to the year 975 mentioned that King Jaya Sadhu Warmadewa ordered residents in the Jula village to fix the Pura Meru or Dharmakula hermitage if damaged. In the process, they could ask help from the villagers of Indrapura, Bubun Dalam, and Hiliran. <sup>48</sup> In 967 years, there was an inscription which was found in Kintamani stating that Shiva monks obeyed all the rules of the village. The inscription also stated the existence of a temple called Pura Hyang Api or Agni Çala.<sup>49</sup> There were also inscriptions in 960, which, among other things, mentioned about the making of lake of holy water sources in the Manukraya village, called thirtha (holy water) in Air Hampul (now Tirta Empul).<sup>50</sup>

In an inscription dated 955 reported on King Agni Nripati who built a statue representing Punta Hyang, which means *mahaguru* (grand master) or Maharsi Agastya.<sup>51</sup> This inscription also mentioned the term Garudadhwaya meaningGaruda flag, which was

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 46-47.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Gora Sirikan, op. cit. p. 71.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 42.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Sartono Kartodirdjo, op. cit., p, 141

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Maharsi Agastya is a descendant of the Aryan Brahmins. Dynasty starting Maharsi Agastya Bharadwaja. He is the ancestor of Maharsi Bhrigu. Maharsi Bhrigu lowered Parasurama, then Grand Master of Drona. Further successive generations, Ashwatthama, Pallava, Agastya, Kaundinia, and Kundungga. N. D. Pandit Shastri, *op. cit.*, p. 58.

commonly used by followers of Waisnama. <sup>52</sup> In 915 there was an inscription made by Ugrasena, a king who ruled in Bali until the year 942. Previously, there were also inscriptions of 882 to 914,<sup>53</sup> but they had no mention of the discourse of religious practice at that time. <sup>54</sup> Also found was Belanjong inscription in the village of Sanur, in 913,<sup>55</sup> but it did not mention the practice of religious discourse that era.

# Tracking the Concept of Sang Hyang Tunggal in the Past

The historical facts above also shows that there was also no concept of Sang Hyang Tunggal (Almighty God) in the days of ancient Bali as it is interpreted in the first principle of Pancasila. Then when did the concept of Sang Hyang Tunggal appear in the history of Bali? Did the concept appear when Bali was ruled by the rulers designated by the kingdom of Majapahit?

In contrast to the days of Ancient Bali, during the reign of Majapahit in Bali there were no longer kings who celebrated an event by making inscriptions. A piece of copper, bronze, and stone that were used as a medium for the creation of inscriptions were replaced with palm leaves. Therefore, now Bali has four types of traditional historical sources written in palm leaves, the *puranas, piagem, prakempa*, and *babad* (chronicle).

*Purana* is a script which is used as a reference source on the history of a temple. The story in the *puranas* tells about the king and his descendants who are associated with the presence of the gods in the mountains. *Piagem* is a script that contains the story of the ancestors in relation to the puranas and the inscription of a temple. *Prakempa* is a story or a script that contains a trace of ancestors in a village. While the *babad* is a manuscript of the story or trace of ancestral experiences associated with certain names. The events narrated in the *babad* comes from various sources including oral tradition, the voice of people who are possessed by spirits (trance), and the results of contemplation.

Each generation usually always copies back the substance of the traditional sources of his history, so it is difficult to deny entry-inclusion of elements of personal or group interests in the working process. Therefore, it is very difficult to use historical sources in the days of Majapahit in Bali as a measuring tool to determine the origin of a religious discourse today. Because so many versions will be found on a discourse. As a way out, the historical events

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> I Goesti N. Pandji Tisna, "Sejak bilakah Poelau Bali mendapat peradaban Hindoe," Djatajoe, No. 5, 25 December 1936, Tahoen ka 1, p. 165.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> R. Goris, *op. cit.*, p. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Goris argues, the figure in the making Belanjong inscription written using Khécara Wahmi Murti candrasangkala. This symbol is read from the back into Murti Wahmi Khécara. Murti means Çarira Çarira or the body of Shiva whose value is 8; Wahmi means of fire, whose value is 3; while Khécara means the planet, the value of 9; so if combined into Çaka 839 (917 AD). See, R. Goris, *Ibid.*, p. 4.

mentioned in these traditional sources must be positioned as a mental fact, so no need to be tested for the levels of authenticity and validity. That mechanism is used to create a description of the history of Bali during the reign of the ruler formed by Majapahit kingdom as described below.

Mentioned by so many writers of history, after defeating Çri Astasura ratna bhûmi banten, the ruler of Majapahit allegedly appointed I Gusti Pasek Gelgel as King of Bali. He was then given the title Kyayi I Gusti Agung Gelgel Pasek and reigned from 1343 to 1350. After that, in 1352 Gajah Mada appointed Çri Krishna Kepakisan as duke [viceroy] King of Majapahit in Bali and the kingdom was based in Samprangan. <sup>56</sup> Dalem Ketut Ngulesir, which was one of the king's sons, then moved to the center of the kingdom of Samprangan to Gelgel, Klungkung. Since it was known as the Gelgel Kingdom. Dalem Ketut Ngulesir was succeeded by his son, Dalem Watu Renggong ruling as King of Gelgel from 1460 to 1550. Dalem Watu Renggong was also succeeded by his son, Dalem Pangharsa, better known by the name of Dalem Bekung, the king had no offsprings. <sup>57</sup>

During the reign of the Kingdom of Dalem Bekung the glory of Gelgel declined. One by one the conquered territories outside Bali were separated from Gelgel royal power and declared himself as an independent kingdom. <sup>58</sup> King Dalem Bekung was then succeeded by his brother, Dalem Sagening. He expanded the influence of Gelgel kingdom power through a political marriage. <sup>59</sup> Sagening palace was replaced by I Dewa Anom Pemahyun and awarded the title of Dalem Anom Pemahyun. He was replaced by I Dewa Dimade, with the title Dalem Dimade. In 1655 power was taken by the Supreme Kryan Maruti. <sup>60</sup>

That is the brief history of Bali under the rule of the king designated by Majapahit kingdomduring the preiod of 1352-1650. Even though what seemed more prominent was political affairs, but in the meantime a discourse of religious practice also developed, especially in the days of King Dalem Watu Renggong. At that time a priest from Java named Dang Hyang Nirartha came to Bali. One of the goals of Nirartha arrival to Bali was to participate in the selection of a priest who would lead and enhance *rajasurya* or *aswameda* ceremony hosted by King Dalem Watu Renggong. the performance of the ceremony was intended to confirm based on thespiritual world (*niskala*) all the areas of King Gelgel covering Pasuruan, Blambangan, Puger, Bali, Nusa Penida, Sasak, and Sumbawa. The

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Ida Bagus Sidemen estimated location of Samprangan palace is in front of the Melanting temple, on the north side of the Gianyar and Klungkung highway. See further Ida Bagus Sidemen, "Seribu Tahun Petanu-Pakerisan: Lembah Budaya yang Menyejarah 914-1899 [manuscripts], p. 147.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 136-137.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> See, Ida Bagus Sidemen, "Dari Wilatikta ke Swecapura: Perjalanan Seorang Aktor Relijius," [manuscript], pp. 140-141.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Anon, "History of Gelgel Kingdom: The Beginning Era," posted by Lanang Dawan, download via Google.com. 29 Januari 2014.

spiritual of lowest level nature (*bhur loka*), the middle level nature (*bhuah loka*), and the highest level nature (*swah loka*). <sup>61</sup>

Participants from Bali, only one who passed. He was a priest of the Bujangga sect and declared entitled to lead and enhance the religious ceremony at lowest levels [*bhur loka*]. To search for a priest to be assigned to lead and enhance the ceremony in the middle level of nature, then the King Dalem Watu Renggong invited a priest from Java. One priest from Java who passed was Nirartha. He was believed to be able to lead and enhance the highest level nature of the ceremony [*swah loka*]. <sup>62</sup>

Nirartha successfully graduated after passing the very difficult testing process.<sup>63</sup> For his success, he then was given a position as priest of Gelgel Kingdom [*bhagawanta*] and he was assigned also to purify the world. <sup>64</sup> Inside the position also inherent was the responsibility to save Shiva Siddhanta doctrine that was not eroded by Islam. The responsibilities was outlined by Nirartha by establishing a temple<sup>65</sup> and made the literature up to now become a reference in religious practice in Bali. <sup>66</sup> One of the Nirartha literature entitled "Gaguritan Sebun Bang Kung." As said by Ida Bagus Sidemen that literature contains lessons on the teachings of Shiva Siddhanta. In it, among others, described on trishiva. This concept includes paramashiva, saddhashiva, and mahashiva. Mahashiva is a form of manifestation of the unity of Shiva in managing the world and everyone in it. <sup>67</sup>

Thus, it was clear at the time of the Kingdom Gelgel the term *Sang Hyang Tunggal* (God Almighty) was unknown as found in the first principle of Pancasila. To call God, Balinese Hindus in those days used to use the term Shiva which includes *paramashiva*, *saddhashiva*, and *mahashiva*. Shiva is worshiped at the altar padmasana, which is referred to as a place of worship to bhatara Shivaraditya [solar planet]. <sup>68</sup>

<sup>68</sup> Padmasana shrine is now found throughout Jagatnata Temple in Bali. In footnote number 4 is mentioned Padmasana shrine in the vertical concept, namely the tripurusha including Shiva, Sadashiva, Paramashiva (Shiva).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Compare with footnote number 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> See, Ida Bagus Sidemen, Dari Wilatikta ke Swecapura, op. cit., pp. 187-188.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> In the *babad* sources, as described by Ketut Soebandi, after Pura Uluwatu, Nirartha managed to build the Bukit Payung temple located in the southeast of the village Bualu. Further, respectively Nirartha build temple Sakenen temple [which according to Ketut Wiana already exist in the eleventh century], Er Jeruk or Airjeruk Temple in the northern of Timbul Sukawati village, Tugu temple in Tegaltugu village, Tengkulak temple, Goa Lawah, and Ponjok Batu. See further, Jro Mangku Gde Ketut Soebandi, *Babad Warga Brahmana: Pandita Sakti Wawu Rawuh, Asal-usul, Peninggalan, dan Keturunan Danghyang Nirartha* [Denpasar: Pustaka Manikgeni, 1998], pp. 19-20. While historians Ida Bagus Sidemen said, in addition to Rambut Siwi temple, Tanah Lot, Uluwatu, Bukit Payung, Er Jeruk, Tengkulak, and Ponjok Batu, Nirartha also build Peti Tenget Canggiling temple, Batu Gong, Geger, Merta Sari, Masceti, Gandamayu, Silayukti, and Taman Pule.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> According to Ketut Soebandi number of literary works created by Nirartha totaling about 21 pieces, namely the Kidung Sebun Bangkung, Sarakusuma, Ampik, Legarang, Mahisa Langit, Hewer, Mayadawaantaka, Dharma Pitutur, Wasista Sraya, Kawya Dhama Putud, Dharma Sunya Keling, Manisa Megat ung, Kakawin Anjang Nirartha, Wilwit Denung Sawit, Gagutuk Menur, Berathi Sesana, Shiva Sesana, Putra Sesana, Tuan Semeru, dan Kidung Aji Pengukiran. See, Jro Mangku Gde Ketut Soebandi, *Babad Warga Brahmana: Pandita Sakti Wawu Rawuh, Asal-usul, Peninggalan, dan Keturunan Danghyang Nirartha* [Denpasar: Pustaka Manikgeni, 1998], p. 61.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> See further Ida Bagus Sidemen, "Dari Wilatikta ke Swecapura, *op. cit.*, pp. 418-425.

The peak of Padmasana shrine with a picture of the Acintya statue is a symbol of Shiva Acintya or Shiva Raditya as Mahashiva and is believed to have merged with Sang Hyang Widhi (God). In the body [middle] of *padmasana* there is swan sculpture decoration which is the vehicle of The god Brahma. At the bottom of padmasana there is a statue Benawang Nala [turtle] as the embodiment of The god Vishnu statue. based on unity, according to Ida Bagus Sideman, decoration in padmasana indicates the concept of Trimurti, namely Shiva as padmasana [*swah loka*], Brahma as the central body of [*bwah loka*], and Vishnu as the basis [*bhur loka*].<sup>69</sup>

But according to Stuart-Fox, the emergence of padmasana shrine in the temple architecture in Bali was to be presented to Nirartha as the founder of Shiva Brahmin descent group. Padmasana existence as a major shrine in Besakih Temple just started since the beginning of the XIX century. But its form was not a single Padmasana as it is commonly known today in Bali, but padmasana tiga, that is, three shrines formed into a single unit. Each shrine stands on a Bedawang Nala ridden by cosmic dragon Basuki and Antaboga. The shrine is seen as a place of worship of God in the form of tripurusa, namely Shiva, Sadashiva, and Paramashiva.<sup>70</sup>

Thus, there are two different opinions on padmasana shrine. Historian Ida Bagus Sideman said that Dang Hyang Niratha is the creator of a single padmasana. While Stuart-Fox argues that padmasana is not created by Dang Hyang Nirartha, but only a dedicationfor him. Therefore it is difficult to obtain an answer, which is true of these two opinions. But there is something to be learned from the two experts, both Ida Bagus Sideman and Fox say that Padmasana is a single-Raditya Shiva shrines, in which Shiva is the ruler of the sun. This is one of the many names of God in the Saiva Sidantha doctrine in Bali. These facts indicate that until the nineteenth century in Bali the term Sang Hyang Tunggal was not known in understanding the Almighty God as expressed in the first principle of Pancasila.

If that is the case, then when was the concept of Sang Hyang Tunggal brought into use in Bali? In the era of Dutch colonial rule, Balinese people commonly refer to something divine as Sang Hyang Embang.<sup>71</sup> However, the organic intellectuals of the era preferred to use the term Shiva. In 1929, one of them said, Shiva must be interpreted in two ways, ie, inwardly and outwardly. Inwardly, Shiva is Sanghyang Wisesa, while outwardly Shiva is the king.<sup>72</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> See, Ida Bagus Sidemen, "Seribu Tahun Petanu-Pakerisan..., op. cit., pp. 133-134.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> See further, David J. Stuart-Fox, *Pura Besakih Pura, Agama, dan Masyarakat Bali* (Jakarta: Pustaka Larasan, Udayana University Press, KITLV, 2010), pp. 94-95.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> J.L. Swellengrebel, "Some Religious Problems of Todyas," *Bali: Stuidies in Life, Thought, and Ritual,* J.L. Swellengrebel, et al., ed. (Amsterdam: The Royal Tropical Institute, 1960), pp. 71-73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> "Lain Doeloe Lain Sekarang Sabda K.T. Caron Waktu Memasrahkan Pangkat Anak Agung," *Bali Adnjana*, Tanpa Nomor, 27 November 1929, Tahoen VI, p. 4.

The term Sang Hyang Tunggal also called Sang Hyang Widhi emerged in 1937,<sup>73</sup> but there was no unity of view in its implementation. They just say, that at the time of worship Sang Hyang Widhi, the mind must be directed to a single goal by thinking about who is being worshiped. For the sake of simplicity, because it is made in the form of a statue shrine known as the seat of Sang Hyang Widhi. But the object that is worshiped instead of the statue, but Sang Hyang Widhi who sits on it. <sup>74</sup>

In that period there was an organic intellectual who analogize Sang Hyang Widhi as King. He said, that though the king was alone, but as the ruler of the world he has many subordinate workers. Therefore, the people not only respect the king, but also all royal officials holding positions ranging from highest to lowest. <sup>75</sup> So, as with the king, Sang Hyang Widhi also has subordinate officials. Therefore there was no harm in honor of the gods, though to the lowest degree though. What is more, after being grouped together, the gods will be summed up into one, namely Shiva, meaning that everything is part of it.

Even if there was already evidence of the Balinese worship the Shiva, but it does not mean that they embraced Shiva, because Shiva in Indian religion is different from that of Bali. Therefore it would be more appropriate to call the religion professed by the majority of the people of Bali as a mixture of religion. The mixture of religion means that the Balinese religion was mixed with Hindu civilization. Based on such thoughts, they more appropriately called the religion of Bali Bali Hindu religion, meaning the religion of Bali mixed with Hindu. However, Hinduism is not a religion but rather the name of a country. In Hindu country (India) there was a variety of religions, so it is not true anyway if Bali religion is said to be the Balinese Hindu religion. <sup>76</sup>

In 1949 the majority of the organic intellectuals were unanimous in calling the religion of Bali as a Tirta religion and the Shiva-Buddha priests is the teacher. <sup>77</sup> But the deal was annulled in 1952 in a religious meeting in Tampaksiring. The majority of the meeting participants agreed to use the name of Hindu Bali religion. In 1954 the name of the Balinese Hindu religion has been used for official agency letters in Bali administration. So since then the name Balinese Hindu has been used for administrative affairs. <sup>78</sup> But there was also an organic intellectual who does not agree with the decision. They want to use the name of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Easy to predict the emergence of the term can not be separated from the influence of Christian groups who at that time had used the term Ida Sang Hyang Wasa Widhi to mention the name of Allah

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> "Kebingoengan kita tentang agama," *Djatajoe*, No. 4, 25 November 1937, Th. Ka 2, pp. 97-98.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> "Notulen Verslang (*sic*) from Congress PP in Singaradja from 16 to 19 November 1949, p. 9. This documents belonging to Prof. Dr. I Gusti Ngurah Bagus, deceased, and its copies are kept by the Office of Professional Historians Tri Sadhana Putra (TSP) *Art and Science Writing*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> See further, I Ketut Kandia, "Sekedar Tentang Usaha Pembinaan: Agama Hindu-Bali," *Bhakti*, No. 6, Tahun III, 15 March 1954, p. 1.

Hindu religion, because there is a difference in meaning between the Hindu religion and Balinese Hinduism.<sup>79</sup>

The debate over the name of religion finally stopped after the President of the Republic of Indonesia issued a Decree No. 1 of 1965. in The decree determined that the Hindu religion (not Hindu Bali) is a religion equal with other religions and has been gaining recognition from the Government of the Republic of Indonesia.<sup>80</sup>

## Influence of Political Islam to Appearance Discourse of Trimurti and Sang Hyang Tunggal

The facts revealed in the description above, shows that the concept of the Trinity and Sang Hyang Tunggal especially if interpreted as Almighty God (as in the first principle of Pancasila) is an "invented religion." Because it is a religious activity that originates in both discourses can also be referred to as an inventing religious practice, built, and formally realized. It can also be referred to as a religious practice that emerged in a relatively short time, which in recent years has been regarded as an established practice Hinduism, relics of a bygone era. What factors are finalizing the birth of the two discourses?

These factors should be sought in claims of the organic intellectual of political Islam in the early 1950s, who claimed that the first item in Pancasila (Belief in God Almighty) is only found in monotheistic religions. Therefore, the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia only recognizes the existence of religions that already have prophets and scripture alone, so the Balinese Hindu religion was knocked out, just being a cult. <sup>81</sup>

The organic intellectuals Bali and united to face the challenges of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia. They immediately translate the term God Almighty in Balinese into Ida Sang Hyang Widhi. <sup>82</sup> But the political Islamic groups in the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia were not been satisfied. On December 28, 1950 they sent messengers to Bali to ask for an explanation of Balinese religious identity, which included the name of religion, philosophy and divinity belief, the existence of religious schools, the name of the holy book and the rituals and prayers meanings. <sup>83</sup>

Since the advent of the incident, there was upheaval in Balinese religion. As seen from the birth of a number of socio-religious organization, which had previously complemented, among others Majelis Hinduisme, which is based on the principle of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> See further, Wastu M., "Menjambut Sabha ke-II Parisada Hindu Dharma," *Suluh Marhaen Edisi Bali*, 29 Nopember 1968.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> Leo Howe, *Hinduism a Hierarchy in Bali*, (American Southwest : SAR Press, 2001), p. 147.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> J.L. Swellengrebel, "Some Religious Problems of Todyas," op. cit., pp. 71-73.

<sup>83</sup> See, I.G.R. Anandakusuma, Pergolakan Hindu Dharma II (Denpasar: Pustaka Balimas, 1966), pp. 84-

Hinduism and aims to harmonize customs and Bali Hinduism with development of modern times; <sup>84</sup> Wiwadha Shastra Sabhha that aims to study and discuss texts Balinese Hinduism; <sup>85</sup> and Panti Agama Hindu Bali who aspire to deepen the knowledge of Balinese Hindu philosophy, simplifying the Balinese Hindu rituals and customs that do not change according to the times.<sup>86</sup>

On June 10, 1951 the leaders of socio-religious organization in Bali held a meeting to discuss the demands of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia. They agreed to send the decision results of the meeting to the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia in Jakarta and other key officials in the country.<sup>87</sup> The result of the meeting contains four counts, namely the placement of Balinese religious representatives in the offices of religion, the formation of the committee drafting the book of Balinese religious teachings, cost of living allowances for religious leaders, and religious interest donations. But the demand was rejected by the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia.<sup>88</sup>

After the incident, there appeared a polemic between the organic intellectual Bali with organic intellectual political Islam in the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia.<sup>89</sup> Polemical intensity increased in 1953, after the emergence of the discourse on the establishment of the Islamic State of Indonesia. 90 In addition in the form of polemic, resistance to organic intellectual political Islam in Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia was accomplished by establishing the Regional Office of Religious Affairs (district) Autonomous, as a counterpoint to the Regional Office of Religious Affairs (district) under the auspices of the Office of Religious Affairs of the Province of Sunda Kecil.91

The establishment of the Autonomous Regional Office of Religious Affairs (district) Hindu had not yet resolved the issue with the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia. One other problem that cannot be resolved was whether the Balinese religion was truly religious or a cult?

Students who were members of the organizations of the Association of Indonesian Students in Jakarta and Bali answered that question by inviting Rauh Made Kemenuh, to give a religious lecture. This activity took place on July 2, 1953 in girls' dormitory of General

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> "Anggaran Dasar Madjelis Hinduisme," (This documents belonging to Sri Rsi Ananda Kusuma, deceased, and its copies are kept by the Office of Professional Historians Tri Sadhana Putra (TSP) Art and Science Writing).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> See, Frederik Lambertus Bakker, The Struggle of the Hindu Balinese Intellectuals: Developments in Modern Hindu Thingking in Independent Indonesia (Amsterdam: VU University Press, 1993), pp. 227.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 85-86.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Ibid.

<sup>88</sup> I.G.R. Anandakusuma, op. cit., pp. 85-87.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> See, Wedastera Suyasa "Agama Hindu Bali Terancam," *Bhakti*, Th. 1, 15 September 1952.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> See, I Gst. Bgs. Sugriwa, "Rasa-tjinta terhadap kesatuan-bangsa," Damai, No. 3, Tahun ke- I, 17 Mei 1953, p. 3. <sup>91</sup> See, A.J. Wirjono, "Bagaimana dengan Kantor Agama," *Bhakti*, Tahun 1, 1 Desember '52, p. 19.

Hospital Center, Jakarta. <sup>92</sup> The lecture of Pedanda Made Kemenuh among others said, that Hinduism is derived from the word Sindu, which means purity, but the Balinese people say of the Buddhist or Shiva Tirta religions. Balinese religion does acknowledge many gods, but not necessarily acknowledge understanding of polytheism, because Bali religion also recognizes God Almighty called Sang Hyang Embang or Sang Hyang Widhi, in accordance with manifestation, namely Shiva, Vishnu, and Brahma, the three forms but single. <sup>93</sup>

Pedanda Made Kemenuh further said, Balinese religion had Shahadah called Pacaradan (credo) of "Aum Tat Sat Ekamewadwitiyam" which means that Sang Hyang Widhi is perfect, just a second to none.<sup>94</sup> Hinduism also has a prophet, namely Bhagavan Viasa (son of Bhagavan Parasara and Devi Satiawati) who was born in the Delta of the Ganges, India. Hindus also have holy scripture, namely Lontar Sarasamuscaya, which contains the teachings of the Asta Dasa Parwa.<sup>95</sup>

The description above shows that Bali has captured the organic intellectual knowledge hidden behind the discourse of expression posed by the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia to make a power in Hinduism parallel with Islam. So the power relations are very transparent in contemporary Hindu religious discourse that includes the name of religion, philosophy and divinity belief, the existence of religious schools, the name of the holy book and the rituals and prayers meanings.

Although already trying to align themselves with the religion of Islam, but until the mid 1958 Bali organic intellectuals struggled in demanding a recognition of the status of Hindu in the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia has yet to show results. Therefore, a number of organic intellectuals Hindu joint action movement in Indonesia. The movement included the attachment of posters, placards, pamphlets, submission of a statement demanding the inclusion of Balinese Hindu religion in the local office in order to be forwarded to the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, by holding a parade with traditional costumes, and and following the news development in the newspaper *Suara Indonesia* concerning the struggles of the delegation of Bali in Jakarta.<sup>96</sup>

On June 26, 1958 the leaders of the Hindu socio-religious organizations held a meeting in the city of Denpasar. This meeting produced a resolution that consisted of three demands to the government of the Republic of Indonesia.<sup>97</sup> On June 29, 1958 five leaders of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Redaktur Keliling Kita, "Mendengarkan Tjeramah Keagamaan," *Bhakti*, Th. II. 1 September 1953, p.
20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Compare with footnote number 73 which states in 1937 was already known concept of *Sang Hyang Widh*i, but there is no unified view of the implementation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> Redaktur Keliling Kita, "Mendengarkan Tjeramah Keagamaan," loc. cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> See further, "Pertemuan Kerdja Sama Organisasi Agama Hindu Bali Tentang Kedudukan Agama Hindu Bali Dalam Organisasi Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia Denpasar, 26 Djuni 1958," (This

the Hindu socio-religious organizations in Bali met President Soekarno in Tampaksiring, Gianyar, to reinforce the demands for the inclusion of Hindu Bali as part of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia.<sup>98</sup>

On that occasion they read Hindus claim that consists of two parts, namely, the petition askeds President Sukarno's attention to all Balinese Hindus and being given the position as part of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia and the use of authority to the officials of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia so that the demands of all Hindus r could be realized. <sup>99</sup>

President Sukarno met the demands of the leaders of the Hindu socio-religious organizations as seen from the issuance of the Decree of the Minister of Religious Affairs 5 September 1958 No. 2, concerning the inclusion of Hindu Bali in the Indonesian Ministry of Religious Affairs. After the recognition, on October 7, 1958 Bali organic intellectuals initiated the establishment of the Supreme Council of Hindus.<sup>100</sup> But the idea could only be realized at the time organizing Hinduism conferences on 21-23 February 1959 at the Faculty of Letters, Airlanga University in Bali, which became known as the birth of the Hindu Supreme Council.<sup>101</sup>

The conference participants agreed to make a decision, which set up a council named Parisada Dharma Hindu Bali (PDHB), has now turned into Hindu Association of Indonesia (PHDI). Entering the 1960s, the organic intellectuals of Bali utilized PDHB to build the culture of Bali, particularly with respect to religious practices. This was revealed in a conference entitled "The Dharma Açrama Para Sulinggih and Para Walaka Hindu Bali" taking place in Campuan Ubud from 17 to 23 November 1961.

I Gusti Ngurah Bagus, one of the speakers at the conference, among others, said, that in the palm inscription "Ciwagama" mentioned building the *rong telu* (three spaces) in the family temple (*sanggah*) or the commonly temple is a place of worship of God in the Trinity concept, but lay people refer to it as a place of ancestor worship. Therefore, he suggested that the notion of *rong telu* contained in the temple and the Puras Kahyangan Tiga as a place of worship that served as the dogma of the Trinity and distributed to all Hindus. In this way, the

documents belonging to Prof. Dr. I Gusti Ngurah Bagus, deceased, and its copies are kept by the Office of Professional Historians Tri Sadhana Putra (TSP) Art and Science Writing.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> The five men were Pedanda Gde Made Kemenuh (from The Paruman Para Pandita), I Gusti Ananda Kusuma (from The Satya Hindu Dharma in Denpasar), Ida Bagus Wajan Gede (from The Yayasan Dwijendra in Denpasar), Ida Bagus Dosther (from The Angkatan Pemuda Hindu Bali di Denpasar), and I Ketut Kandia ( The Panti Agama Hindu Bali). See I.G.R. Anandakusuma, *op. cit.*, p. 102.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 103.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> "Panitia Perantjang Hindu-Bali Sabha (Dewan Agama Hindu Bali) d/a Dinas Agama Otonom Daerah Swatantra – I Bali, Denpasar, Ketentuan Pokok Tentang Hindu Bali Sabha," (Dokumen milik Prof. Dr. I Gusti Ngurah Bagus, deceased and its copies are kept by the Office of Professional Historians Tri Sadhana Putra (TSP) *Art and Science Writing*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> In this case, the organic intellectuals of Bali far behind the organic intellectuals of the Bali Christian, who in 1949 already has synod (Protestant Christian Church of Bali). Results Interview with Pastor Tjatra Puspita, in Dalung Badung, age 65 years, dated October 17, 2002.

Hindus will be able to leave the local elements and ancestor worship in the effort to form a universal Hindu.



Sample of The Pura Kahyangan Tiga ( The Pura Bale Agung). Taken from Google.com

After the conference, Bali organic intellectuals seemed preoccupied by the desire to conform to the demands of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, that the Balinese Hindu religion is strictly monotheistic. To achieve these objectives, based on Decree No.. KPTS-128/6/1962, Regional Commander IX / Udayana, on June 25, 1962 built Jagatnata Temple in Denpasar. <sup>102</sup> In contrast to the temple in general, which usually consists of various kinds and forms of worship altar, in Jagatnata Temple there is only a single padmasana shrine form.

So it seems obvious, there are relations of power in the history of Jagatnata Temple, because as mentioned by I Gusti Ngurah Bagus, if only to worship God, it wasenough to do it in the *rong telu* shrine, both located on the *kahyangn tiga* temple and the *kawitan* temple. Because the *rong telu* shrine is a place of worship of God in the concept of the Trimuti, ie Brahma, Vishnu, and Shiva, which when squeezed it would be singular, ie, Sanghyang Widhi Wasa or God Almighty. But for the sake of showing the nature of Hinduism as monotheistic, then padmasana shrine is built but not only built in Jagatnata Temple, but also in every *kahyangan tiga* temple.<sup>103</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> I.G.R. Anandakusuma, op. cit., p. 114-115.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 16-17.



The Padmatiga Altar in The Besakih Temple at Karangasem Regency. Taken from Google.

The existence of the above-mentioned policy further clarifies that in the religious practices, the Hindu community in Bali (including policy Hindu makers) interprets the *rong telu* shrine as a place of ancestor worship not as a place of God worship in the concept of the Trimurti as it was in a mental fact of the intellectuals or academics. Thus, the policy to build a shrine at each *kahyangan tiga* temple is not intended to create the Tapak Dara symbols (+), because the concept has multiple interpretations. This symbol can be interpreted not only as a meeting between God in the vertical concept and the horizontal concept, but it can also be a meeting between Shiva and the Buddhist religion as believed by some of today's Hindu organic intellectuals.<sup>104</sup>



The Tapak Dara Symbols. Taken from Google.com

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Look back Footnote number 4

Based on the above analysis, it can be said that the *padmasana* shrine being a symbol of a new monotheistic Hinduism is known after the demands of political Islamic groups in the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia in the early 1950s.

## Conclusion

None of the inscriptions that mention a meeting of religious leaders at the Samuan Tiga Temple at the time of the Ancient Bali (X to XIV century). There was also no evidence of a conflict of artifacts that proclaim eleven cults, so it must be integrated into three, Brahma, Vishnu, Shiva called Trimurti. In the days of ancient Bali there occured religious tolerance. Each king always gives special attention to the religious leaders of different beliefs to their religion. Anyone who ruled as king never destroys other religions.

Thus, when viewed from the standpoint of Archaeology, Trimurni concept can be referred to as "invented religion." That means the worshipping practice of God in the Trimurti concept in the Samuan Tiga Temple which is inherited to the present is not a continuation of the X century discourse as stated by a number of intellectuals at the present. Hence the Trimurti practice of worship in the Samuan Tiga Temple can be called a religious practice that is invented, built, and formally realized. It can also be referred to as a religious tradition that emerged in a relatively short time, which in a few years is considered as an established practice of Hinduism.

Similarly, the practice of the worship of God in the concept of Sang Hyang Tunggal (as defined as one God in the first principle of Pancasila) on the altar of single padmasana in The Jagatnata Temple is not a continuity of religious discourse in the past. The worship practices derived from a discourse that emerged and evolved since the 1950s when the Balinese religion was under attack from the political Islamic groups in the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia.

The conclusion was based on the consideration that the experts still disagree about the history of the birth of a single *padmasana* shrine. One view says Dang Hyang Niratha is the sole creator of padmasana. While the opinion of the others mentioned *padmasana* is not created by Dang Hyang Niartha, but only a shrine dedicated to him. And the existence of *padmasana* in Pura Besakih begins only in the nineteenth century.

Anyone who is faced with the opposite historical data even when compiled solely based on traditional historical sources, it would have difficulty in determining which option is true of the two opinions. Therefore, both Ida Bagus Sideman and Stuart Fox equally say that single Padmasana is a Raditya shrines of Shiva, Shiva as the ruler of the sun. That means until the nineteenth century, there was no term of Sang Hyang Tunggal, especially in understanding the Almighty God as expressed in the first principle of Pancasila. The Sang Hyang Tunggal concept became newly known in the 1930s, but there was no unity of view in its implementation. At the time the Sang Hyang Widhi was made analogous to a king who had a lot of subordinates. Sang Hyang Widhi subordinate officials are the gods that must be worshiped. So they tend to pattern a religion of polytheism. it was only in the 1950s Sang Hyang Widhi term began to be used to translate the Almighty God as interpreted in the first principle of Pancasila. It is part of the efforts of Balinese organic intelectuals to show to others that Balinese religion is truly singular as required by the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia. However, in practice, the majority of Balinese Hindus to this day still have not been able to practice only worshipping God on the *padmasana* altar, but remains on a whole range of forms and functions shrine, among others the *rong telu*, the Kahyangan Tiga temple, and The Melanting temple.

On the basis of these, a conclusion can be drawnthat the practice of worship of God, both in the concept of the Trimurti in the Samuan Tiga temple and the padmasana altar is full of power relations. The goal is to maintain the existence of Hindus in the middle of the "ocean" of Islam, so that it can be said that the religious practice is only an "invented religion."

### References

A.J. Wirjono. 1952. "Bagaimana dengan Kantor Agama." Bhakti, Tahun 1, 1 Desember.

Anandakusuma, I.G.R.. 1966. Pergolakan Hindu Dharma II. Denpasar: Pustaka Balimas.

- Anon. "Anggaran Dasar Madjelis Hinduisme." (This documents belonging to Sri Rsi Ananda Kusuma, deceased, and its copies are kept by the Office of Professional Historians Tri Sadhana Putra (TSP) *Art and Science Writing*.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2014. "Sejarah Pura Samuantiga." *Babadbali.com.* Rabu, 24 Oktober 2012, download via http://www.google.co.id 15 May.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2014. "Pura Jagatnata." Stiti Dhrama Online, download via http://www. google.co.id 15 May.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2014. "Ciwa-Budha-Konsep Dasar," Bali Spiritual Center, Paguyuban Dharma Giri Utama, Jumat 24 Agustus 2009, download via http://www. google.co.id 15 May.
- . 2014. "Pura Jagatnata." Stiti Dhrama Online, download via http://www. google.co.id 15 May.
- \_\_\_\_\_\_. 1958. "Pertemuan Kerdja Sama Organisasi Agama Hindu Bali Tentang Kedudukan Agama Hindu Bali Dalam Organisasi Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia Denpasar, 26 Djuni." This documents belonging to Prof. Dr. I Gusti Ngurah Bagus, deceased, and its copies are kept by the Office of Professional Historians Tri Sadhana Putra (TSP) *Art and Science Writing*.

- . 1929. "Lain Doeloe Lain Sekarang Sabda K.T. Caron Waktu Memasrahkan Pangkat Anak Agung." *Bali Adnjana*, Tanpa Nomor, 27 November, Tahoen VI.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 1949. "Notulen Verslang (*sic*) dari Congress PP di Singaradja pada tanggal 16 s/d 19 Nopember. This documents belonging to Prof. Dr. I Gusti Ngurah Bagus, deceased, and its copies are kept by the Office of Professional Historians Tri Sadhana Putra (TSP) *Art and Science Writing*.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2014. "Sejarah Kerajaan Gelgel: Awal berdirinya," diposkan oleh Lanang Dawan, download via Google.com. 29 Januari.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2014. "Sejarah Kerajaan Gelgel: Awal berdirinya." Diposkan oleh Lanang Dawan, download via Google.com. 29 Januari.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2014. "Sejarah Kerajaan Gelgel: Awal berdirinya," diposkan oleh Lanang Dawan, download via Google.com. 29 Januari.
- Foucault, Michel. 1980. *Power/Knowledge*. Colin Gordon, ed., trans. Colin Gordon, Leo Marshall, John Mepham, Kate Soper. Sussex: The Harvester Press.
- Gobyah, I Ketut, 2014. "Memuja Batara Tri Purusa." Bali Post Online, 3 Januari 2007, download via http://www.google.co.id 15 May.
- Gora Sirikan. 1956, "Pulau Bali dalam Masa-Masa yang Lampau." Jilid I (manuscripts),
- Goris, R., 1948. Sejarah Bali Kuno. Singaraja: tanpa penerbit, Oktober-November.
- Gramsci, Antonio. 1971. *Slection From The Prison Notebooks*, edited and translated by Quintin Hoare and Geoffrey Nowell Smith. New York: International Publisher.
- Howe, Leo. 2001. Hinduism a Hierarchy in Bali. American Southwest : SAR Press.
- Konrad Kebung. 2002. "Kembalinya Moral Melalui Seks." *Basis*, No. 01 02, Tahun Ke- 51, Januari-Februari.
- Lambertus Bakker, Frederik. 1993. The Struggle of the Hindu Balinese Intellectuals: Developments in Modern Hindu Thingking in Independent Indonesia. Amsterdam: VU University Press.
- Moeflich Hasbullah, 2012. Moeflich Hasbullah, "Konstruksi Pemikiran Michel Foucault Tentang Sejarah." *Download* melalui http://www.google.co.id/ tanggal 19 Oktober.
- Pandit Shastri, N.D.. 1963. Sejarah Bali Dwipa Djilid I. Denpasar: Bhuva Saraswati.
- Pandji Tisna, I Goesti N.. 1936. "Sejak bilakah Poelau Bali mendapat peradaban Hindoe," Djatajoe, No. 5, 25 December, Tahoen ka 1.
- Panitia Perantjang Hindu-Bali Sabha (Dewan Agama Hindu Bali) d/a Dinas Agama Otonom Daerah Swatantra – I Bali, Denpasar, Ketentuan Pokok Tentang Hindu Bali Sabha." This documents belonging to Prof. Dr. I Gusti Ngurah Bagus, deceased and its copies are kept by the Office of Professional Historians Tri Sadhana Putra (TSP) *Art and Science Writing*.
- Philpott, Simon, 2003. *Meruntuhkan Indonesia: Politik Postkolonial dan Otoritarianisme*, terj. Nuruddin Mhd. Ali, Uzair Fauzan. Yogyakarta: LKIS.

- Redaktur Keliling Kita. 1953. "Mendengarkan Tjeramah Keagamaan." *Bhakti*, Th. II. 1 September.
- Richard.J. Evans, 1997. In Defence of History. London: Granta Book.
- Sartono Kartodirdjo, et al.. 1975. Sejarah Nasional Indonesia, Jilid II. Jakarta: Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.
- Sidemen, Ida Bagus. "Seribu Tahun Petanu-Pakerisan: Lembah Budaya yang Menyejarah 914-1899 (manuscripts).
  - \_\_\_\_\_. "Dari Wilatikta ke Swecapura: perjalanan seorang aktor religius [manuscripts]
- Soebandi, Jro Mangku Gde Ketut. 1998. Babad Warga Brahmana: Pandita Sakti Wawu Rawuh, Asal-usul, Peninggalan, dan Keturunan Danghyang Nirartha. Denpasar: Pustaka Manikgeni.
- Stuart-Fox, David J.. 2010. Pura Besakih Pura, Agama, dan Masyarakat Bali. Jakarta: Pustaka Larasan, Udayana University Press, KITLV.
- Swellengrebel, J.L. 1960. "Some Religious Problems of Todyas," *Bali: Stuidies in Life, Thought, and Ritual, J.L.* Swellengrebel, et al., ed. Amsterdam: The Royal Tropical Institute.
- Sugriwa, I Gst. Bgs.. 1953. "Rasa-tjinta terhadap kesatuan-bangsa." *Damai*, No. 3, Tahun ke-I, 17 Mei.
- Wastu M. 1968, "Menjambut Sabha ke-II Parisada Hindu Dharma." Suluh Marhaen Edisi Bali, 29 Nopember.

Wedastera Suyasa. 1952. "Agama Hindu Bali Terancam." Bhakti, Th. 1, 15 September.

Yasraf Amir Piliang. 2014. Dunia Yang Dilipat, Tamasya Melampaui Batas-Batas Kebudayaan.Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.